



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 10, 2019

Ms. Brittaney N. Davis  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Fort Worth  
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor  
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2019-09632

Dear Ms. Davis:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 758868 (PIR# W080479).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department will release some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state, and provide documentation showing, the department notified the next of kin of a deceased individual of the right to submit comments to this office why the information at issue should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have received and considered comments from a representative for the next of kin of the deceased individual. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See id.*

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes.

Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) for release of the body worn camera recordings at issue. The submitted recordings reflect they were required to be made by law or the policies of the department and relate to a law enforcement purpose. *See id.* § 1701.661(h). We understand the recordings are or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution. *See id.* § 1701.661(d) (stating information “that is or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution is subject to the requirements of [the Act.]”). Additionally, we have no indication the recordings document incidents involving the use of deadly force by an officer or relate to an administrative or criminal investigation of an officer. *See id.* § 1701.660(a). The recordings demonstrate they were not made in a private space for the purposes of section 1701.661(f). *See id.* §§ 1701.661(f), .651(3) (defining “private space” for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person’s authorized representative.

*Id.* § 1701.661(f). You state the video recordings at issue consist of body worn camera recordings involving an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and which did not result in an arrest. You further state the department does not have permission for release from all of the subjects of the recordings at issue. *See id.* Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. We note the remaining recording consists of a dashboard camera video recording. This information does not consist of a body worn camera

recording. Therefore, the remaining information is not subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490, 492 (5th Cir. 1985)). However, because privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the constitutional right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. See *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); see also Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Nevertheless, the United States Supreme Court has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. See *Nat'l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 541 U.S. 157 (2004). As noted above, we have received correspondence from the representative of the decedent's next of kin informing us she objects to disclosure of the information at issue. Upon review, we find the family's privacy interest in the remaining information at issue outweighs the public's interest in the disclosure of this information. Accordingly, we conclude the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy and the holding in *Favish*.

In summary, the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy and the holding in *Favish*.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "James M. Graham".

James M. Graham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JMG/mo

Ref: ID# 758868

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)