



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 9, 2019

Ms. Cary Grace
Assistant City Attorney
City of Austin
P.O. Box 1088
Austin, Texas 78767-8828

OR2019-09525

Dear Ms. Grace:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 758627 (R010374).

The Austin Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident.¹ You state the department will release some information, including a police officer's crash report pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. *See* Tranp. Code § 550.065(c) (providing for the release of accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection). You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹We note the department received an initial request for the same information from this requestor on November 28, 2018. In response to the initial request, the department informs us it responded to the requestor within five business days and then withheld certain information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, pursuant to the previous determination this office issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2016-10001 (2016). Subsequently, the requestor made a second request for the same information on January 11, 2019.

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, you state the department failed to meet the statutory deadlines imposed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nevertheless, the submitted information includes officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, which provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) reads as follows:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for one of the body worn camera recordings at issue, which we have indicated. As this body worn camera recording was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a "failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information." *Id.* § 1701.661(b). Nevertheless, the requestor provides the requisite information for the remaining body worn camera recording. *Id.* § 1701.661(a). Section 1701.662(a) of the Occupations Code reads as follows:

Notwithstanding Section 552.301(b), Government Code, a governmental body's request for a decision from the attorney general about whether a requested body worn camera recording falls within an exception to public disclosure is considered timely if made not later than the *20th business day* after the date of receipt of the written request.

Id. § 1701.662(a) (emphasis added). Thus, notwithstanding the failure of the department to comply with section 552.301(b), we find the department timely requested a decision to withhold the remaining body worn camera recording in accordance with section 1701.662(a). Accordingly, we will address your argument under section 552.108 against disclosure of this body worn camera recording.

With regard to the remaining requested information, we note pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See Open Records Decision No. 586* (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Travis County Attorney's Office (the "county attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will also consider whether the department may withhold the remaining information, to include the properly requested body worn camera recording, under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the county attorney's office.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide documentation from the county attorney's office stating, the remaining information pertains to a pending prosecution. We note, however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24 Statutory Warning and DIC-25 Notice of Suspension. A copy of these forms were provided to the arrestee. We find the county attorney's office has not demonstrated releasing this information, which has already been provided to the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). However, based on the county attorney's office's representation and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 77 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *Open Records Decision No. 127* (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms and

basic information, the department may withhold the remaining under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the county attorney's office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."³ Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we marked in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the body worn camera recording we indicated was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. With the exception of the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the county attorney's office. In releasing the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/mo

Ref: ID# 758627

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)