



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 9, 2019

Mr. Marc J. Schnall  
Counsel for the City of Selma  
Langley & Banack, Inc.  
Trinity Plaza II  
745 East Mulberry, Suite 900  
San Antonio, Texas 78212

OR2019-09507

Dear Mr. Schnall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 758502.

The Selma Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving a named individual. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note some of the submitted information consists of a grand jury subpoena. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). The fact that information collected or prepared by another person or entity is submitted to the grand

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

jury does not necessarily mean such information is in the grand jury's constructive possession when the same information also is held in the other person's or entity's own capacity. Information held by another person or entity but not produced at the direction of the grand jury may well be protected under one of the Act's specific exceptions to disclosure, but such information is not excluded from the reach of the Act by the judiciary exclusion. *See* ORD 513. Thus, to the extent the department holds the grand jury subpoena solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act, and the department is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. To the extent the department holds the grand jury subpoena in its own capacity and not solely as an agent of the grand jury, we will address your arguments against its disclosure.

Next, we note the requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of State Health Services ("DSHS"). In her request, the requestor states she is seeking the requested information as part of an investigation she is conducting pursuant to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code provides DSHS or its representative "is entitled to access to records and other documents . . . that are directly related to . . . emergency medical services personnel to the extent necessary to enforce [chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code] and the rules adopted under [chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code]." Health & Safety Code § 773.0612(a). The requestor asserts the submitted information pertains to an emergency medical technician licensed under chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. She also indicates the information is needed to enforce section 157.36(b) of title 25 of the Texas Administrative Code. *See* 25 T.A.C. § 157.36(b). Because the submitted information is directly related to an emergency medical technician and the requestor is conducting an investigation under chapter 773, we conclude section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code applies to the submitted information. A statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). In addition, a statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, section 552.108 of the Government Code, or 552.147 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI

means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI which the department must generally withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find the motor vehicle record information you have marked and we have marked is generally confidential under section 552.130.

Because section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code authorizes the requestor to obtain the submitted information in its entirety and section 411.083 of the Government Code and section 552.130 of the Government Code except from disclosure portions of the submitted information, we find section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code is in conflict with section 411.083 of the Government Code and section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See id.* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Section 773.0612 gives a general right of access to all information related to emergency medical services personnel being investigated by DSHS, while section 411.083 of the Government Code specifically protects CHRI and section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. In addition, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451 at 4. Therefore, we find the confidentiality provided by sections 411.083 and 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 773.0612. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 411.083 of the Government Code and

the motor vehicle record information you have marked and we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department holds the grand jury subpoena solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act, and the department is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 411.083 of the Government Code and the motor vehicle record information you have marked and we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information pursuant to section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Meredith L. Coffman  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MLC/mo

Ref: ID# 758502

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>2</sup>Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.