



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 28, 2019

Ms. Anastasia Broadfoot
Attorney
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission
P.O. Box 13127
Austin, Texas 78711-3137

OR2019-08480

Dear Ms. Broadfoot:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 757060 (ORR# R00480-010719).

The Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission (the "commission") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident, including information regarding a specified entity. You state the commission has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code provides as follows:

- (a) "Private records," as used in this section, means all records of a permittee, licensee, or other person other than the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license, or in a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee.

(b) The private records of a permittee, licensee, or other person that are required or obtained by the commission or its agents, in connection with an investigation or otherwise, are privileged unless introduced in evidence in a hearing before the commission or before a court in this state or the United States.

Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48. The term “privileged” in this statute has been construed to mean “confidential” for purposes of the Act. Attorney General Opinion JM-1235 at 2 (1990); Open Records Decision Nos. 186 (1978), 62 (1974). Thus, section 5.48 makes confidential any records required or obtained by the commission, with the exception of “the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license” and “a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee.” Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48.

You explain the information in Exhibit C consists of application records for commission licenses or permits and communications within the commission related to the application records. You state none of the information at issue has been introduced as evidence in a hearing before the commission or before a court in Texas or the United States. Based upon these representations and our review, we agree the information at issue constitutes private records under section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code. Accordingly, with the exception of the name, proposed location, and type of permit sought in the relevant applications, which you state the commission has released, the commission must withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). By its terms, section 552.108 applies only to a law enforcement agency or a prosecutor. We note the commission’s Enforcement Division is a law enforcement agency. *See* Alco. Bev. Code §§ 5.14 (commission may commission inspectors with police powers to enforce Alcoholic Beverage Code), .36 (commission shall investigate violations of Alcoholic Beverage Code and other laws relating to alcoholic beverages), .361 (commission shall develop risk-based approach to enforcement). You state the information in Exhibit B pertains to a closed criminal investigation of the commission’s enforcement division that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based upon this representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, we note, and you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*

Publishing Co. v. City of Houston, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information, which you state the commission has released, the commission may withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the name, proposed location, and type of permit sought in the relevant applications, which you state the commission has released, the commission must withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code. With the exception of the basic information, which you state the commission has released, the commission may withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/mo

Ref: ID# 757060

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)