



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 18, 2019

Mr. Jonathan Miles
Open Records Attorney
Texas Health and Human Services Commission
P.O. Box 13247
Austin, Texas 78711-3247

OR2019-07484

Dear Mr. Miles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 755126 (HHSC Reference No. 20181218-17230).

The Texas Health and Human Services Commission (the "commission") received a request for any communications between a named individual and a named employee. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. You also state release of the submitted information implicates the interests of the Texas Education Agency (the "TEA"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the TEA of the request for information and of its right to submit comments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released.¹ See Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹As of the date of this letter, this office has not received comments from the TEA explaining why any of the submitted information should not be released.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code. Section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Except for purposes directly connected with the administration of the assistance programs of the commission or Department of Aging and Disability Services [(the “department”)], as applicable, it is an offense for a person to solicit, disclose, receive, or make use of, or to authorize, knowingly permit, participate in, or acquiesce in the use of the names of, or any information concerning, persons applying for or receiving assistance if the information is directly or indirectly derived from the records, papers, files, or communications of the commission or department or acquired by employees of the commission or department in the performance of their official duties.

Hum. Res. Code § 12.003(a). The term “assistance” in section 12.003 includes “all forms of assistance and services for needy persons authorized by Subtitle C” of title 2 of the Human Resources Code. *Id.* § 11.001(1); *see also id.* ch. 31 *et seq.* (Assistance Programs).

In Open Records Decision No. 584 (1991), this office concluded “[t]he inclusion of the words ‘or any information’ juxtaposed with the prohibition on disclosure of the names of [the commission’s] clients clearly expresses a legislative intent to encompass the broadest range of individual client information, and not merely the clients’ names and addresses.” ORD 584 at 3. Consequently, it is the specific information pertaining to individual clients, and not merely the clients’ identities, that is made confidential under section 12.003. *See also* 42 U.S.C. § 1396a(a)(7) (state plan for medical assistance must provide safeguards that restrict use or disclosure of information concerning applicants and recipients to purposes directly connected with administration of plan); 42 C.F.R. §§ 431.300 *et seq.*; Open Records Decision No. 166 (1977).

The commission asserts the information it marked relates to recipients of benefits authorized by subtitle C of title 2 of the Human Resources Code. We understand the release of information at issue in this instance would not be for purposes directly connected with the administration of an assistance program. Based on the commission’s representations and our review, we conclude the commission must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of

section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ). We determined section 552.111 excepts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body's policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body's policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body's policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995).

Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, the factual information also may be withheld under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

Section 552.111 can also encompass communications between a governmental body and a third party, including a consultant or other party with a privity of interest. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 at 9 (1990) (section 552.111 encompasses communications with party with which governmental body has privity of interest or common deliberative process). For section 552.111 to apply, the governmental body must identify the third party and explain the nature of its relationship with the governmental body. Section 552.111 is not applicable to a communication between the governmental body and a third party unless the governmental body establishes it has a privity of interest or common deliberative process with the third party. *See id.*

You state the information you marked consists of advice, opinions, and recommendations of commission staff and TEA staff regarding policymaking matters. You state the commission and the TEA share a privity of interest in the policy matters at issue. Upon review, we find the commission has demonstrated the information it marked consists of advice, opinions, or recommendations on the policymaking matters of the commission.

Thus, the commission may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

In summary, the commission must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code. The commission may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code. The commission must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Buchanan
Attorney
Open Records Division

EB/eb

Ref: ID# 755126

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)