



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 27, 2019

Mr. Whitt L. Wyatt
Counsel for the City of Allen
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, LLP
500 North Akard Street, Suite 1800
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2019-05475

Dear Mr. Wyatt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 759047 (Reference # 105904).

The Allen Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for a specified police report involving the requestor. You state the department has released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); Open Records Decision No. 434 (1986). You state the information you marked pertains to a criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. The department raises section 552.101 in conjunction with the common-law informer's privilege, which Texas courts have long recognized. *See Aguilar v. State*, 444 S.W.2d 935, 937 (Tex. Crim. App. 1969). The informer's privilege protects from disclosure the identities of persons who report activities over which the governmental body has criminal or quasi-criminal

law-enforcement authority. *See* Open Records Decision No. 208 at 1-2 (1978). The informer's privilege protects the identities of individuals who report violations of statutes to the police or similar law-enforcement agencies, as well as those who report violations of statutes with civil or criminal penalties to "administrative officials having a duty of inspection or of law enforcement within their particular spheres." Open Records Decision No. 279 at 1-2 (1981) (citing 8 John H. Wigmore, *Evidence in Trials at Common Law*, § 2374, at 767 (J. McNaughton Rev. Ed. 1961)). The report must be of a violation of a criminal or civil statute. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 582 at 2 (1990), 515 at 4 (1988). However, witnesses who provide information in the course of an investigation but do not make a report of the violation are not informants for the purposes of claiming the informer's privilege. The privilege excepts the informer's statement only to the extent necessary to protect that informer's identity. Open Records Decision No. 549 at 5 (1990). We note the informer's privilege does not apply where the informant's identity is known to the individual who is the subject of the complaint. *See* ORD 208 at 1-2.

You assert portions of the remaining information, which you marked, identify individuals who reported violations of criminal law to the department. We have no indication the subject of the complaint knows the identity of the complainant. Based upon your representations and our review, we conclude you have demonstrated the applicability of the common-law informer's privilege to the information we marked. Therefore, the department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law informer's privilege. However, we find you have not demonstrated the applicability of the informer's privilege to any of the remaining information you marked. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note one of the dates of birth you marked pertains to an individual who will be de-identified, and whose privacy interest will therefore be protected. Therefore, the department may not withhold the date of birth of the de-identified individual under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of the date of birth pertaining to the de-identified individual, the department must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, because section 552.130 protects privacy interests, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a)

(“person or a person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, with the exception of the information pertaining to the requestor, which we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law informer’s privilege. With the exception of the date of birth pertaining to the de-identified individual, the department must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/eb

¹We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Ref: ID# 759047

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)