



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 22, 2019

Mr. Carl Shaw
Assistant Chief Deputy
Harris County Constable Precinct One
1302 Preston, Third Floor
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2019-05142

Dear Mr. Shaw:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 751451.

The Harris County Constable's Office, Precinct One (the "constable's office") received a request for personnel files and working hours related to two named officers. We have reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from an interested third party. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the submitted information contains peace officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers.¹ Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced,

¹The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement by the 83rd Legislature. *See* Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Id. § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officers' TCOLE identification numbers in the responsive information do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."² *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. See Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Thus, the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, and the constable's office must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court has held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the constable's office must withhold the dates of birth of constable's office employees under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code.³ See Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117 also protects a peace officer's personal cellular telephone number if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. See Open Records Decision No. 670 at 6 (2001) (section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from disclosure peace officer's cellular telephone or pager number if officer pays for cellular telephone or pager service). Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, the constable's office may not withhold the cellular telephone numbers at issue under section 552.117(a)(2) if a governmental body pays for the cellular telephone service.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175(b). We note section 552.1175 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. See Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 of the Government Code not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Some of the remaining information may pertain to individuals to which section 552.1175 applies. Accordingly, to the extent the individual at issue is a person listed under section 552.1175(a) of the Government Code and the individual at issue elects to restrict access to the marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, the constable's

³Section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found in article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, including the cellular telephone numbers if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683.

This office has found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy). This office has also determined that a public employee's net pay is protected by common-law privacy even though it involves a financial transaction between the employee and the governmental body. *See* Attorney General Opinion GA-0572 at 3-5 (2007) (stating that net salary necessarily involves disclosure of information about personal financial decisions and is background financial information about a given individual that is not of legitimate concern to the public). However, there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9 (information revealing that employee participates in group insurance plan funded partly or wholly by governmental body is not excepted from disclosure), 545 (1990) (financial information pertaining to receipt of funds from governmental body or debts owed to governmental body not protected by common-law privacy). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note there is a legitimate public interest in an applicant's background and qualifications for government employment. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Additionally, this office has found the public has a legitimate interest in information relating to applicants and employees of governmental bodies and their employment qualifications and job performance, especially where the applicant was seeking a position in law enforcement. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 (1986), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public

citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The constable's office must withhold the submitted accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The constable's office must withhold the dates of birth of constable's office employees under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, including the cellular telephone numbers if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The constable's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, including the cellular telephone numbers if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The constable's office must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The constable's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The constable's office must release the remaining information.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

⁴We note the remaining information includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/gw

Ref: ID# 751451

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)