



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 22, 2019

Mr. Brian Sears
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2019-05116

Dear Mr. Sears:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 751511 (PIR Nos. 19-0326 and 18-8634).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for a specified investigation, including a named individual's personnel file and information pertaining to specified department rules. You state the department will release some responsive information to the first requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note most of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code, which provides, in relevant part:

- (a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information includes a completed investigation subject to section 552.022(a)(1). This information must be released unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you assert the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code, this section is discretionary and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 542 at 4 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 may be waived); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1), which we marked, may not be withheld under section 552.103. Nevertheless, because sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of these sections to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1).¹ We will also address your arguments for the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1).

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). See ORD 551.

You argue the information at issue is related to pending litigation against the department. You inform us, and provide documentation showing, prior to the department's receipt of the instant request for information, litigation styled *Treviño et al. v. Armstrong*, Cause No.18-11-58899-CV, was filed and is currently pending in the in the 79th Judicial District Court of Jim Wells County, Texas. We understand the lawsuit was filed against a department peace officer as a consequence of his employment. You state the information at issue is related to the subject matter of the current litigation. Based upon your representations, the submitted documentation, and our review of the information at issue, we find litigation was pending when the department received the instant request, and we find the information at issue is related to the pending litigation for purposes of section 552.103. Accordingly, the department may withhold the submitted information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing parties in the pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has concluded. See Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); see also Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3 (1982).

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Thus, under *Texas Comptroller*, section 552.102(a) is applicable to the birth date of an employee of a governmental body in a record maintained by his or her employer in an employment context. Accordingly, the department must withhold the employee's date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, because privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. Thus, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Accordingly, the department must withhold the living public citizen’s date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the submitted information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code. In releasing the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code, the department: (1) must withhold the employee’s date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code; (2) must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (3) must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "J. M. Graham". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first letters of each name being capitalized and prominent.

James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/mo

Ref: ID# 751511

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)