



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 6, 2019

Ms. LeAnn M. Quinn
City Secretary
City of Cedar Park
450 Cypress Creek Road
Cedar Park, Texas 78613

OR2019-03485

Dear Ms. Quinn:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 749559 (ORR 19-200).

The Cedar Park Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified report involving a named individual. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit C relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department generally may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, as you acknowledge, the requestor is an investigator for the Texas Education Agency (the "TEA"), which has assumed the duties of the State Board for Educator Certification (the "SBEC").¹ The requestor states the TEA is conducting an investigation of the named individual, who either has applied for or currently holds educator credentials. As mentioned above, the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides the SBEC "may obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information [{"CHRI"}] and all records contained in any closed criminal investigation file that relate to a specific applicant for or holder of a certificate issued under Subchapter B, Chapter 21 [of the Education Code]." Educ. Code § 22.082. Section 411.090 of the Government Code grants the SBEC a right of access to obtain CHRI from the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") regarding persons who have applied to the SBEC. *See* Gov't Code § 411.090. Additionally, section 411.0901 of the Government Code specifically provides the TEA with a right of access to obtain CHRI maintained by DPS regarding certain school employees or applicants for employment. *See id.* § 411.0901. Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS also is authorized to "obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that [agency]." *Id.* § 411.087(a). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2).

We find, when read together, sections 22.082 of the Education Code and 411.087 of the Government Code give the TEA a statutory right of access to some of the submitted information. *Cf. Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined). Thus, we conclude the department must release to this requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for the information at issue, a specific access provision prevails over the general exceptions found in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under Act). Accordingly, the department may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of

¹The 79th Texas Legislature passed House Bill 1116, which required the transfer of the SBEC's administrative functions and services to the TEA, effective September 1, 2005.

privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you have marked in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked in Exhibit B under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release to the requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. The department may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the dates of birth in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the marked motor vehicle record information in Exhibit B under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open_orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/sb

Ref: ID# 749559

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)