



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 5, 2019

Ms. Sarah Parker  
Associate General Counsel  
Texas Department of Transportation  
125 East 11th Street  
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2019-03344

Dear Ms. Parker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 749110.

The Texas Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a specified accident and nine categories of information pertaining to a specified roadway. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code and privileged under section 409 of title 23 of the United States Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency." Section 552.111 encompasses information that is protected by civil discovery privileges. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 647 at 3 (1996), 251 at 2-4 (1980). You contend that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 because it would be privileged from discovery under section 409 of title 23 of the United States Code. Section 409 provides as follows:

Notwithstanding any other provision of law, reports, surveys, schedules, lists, or data compiled or collected for the purpose of identifying, evaluating, or planning the safety enhancement of potential accident sites,

hazardous roadway conditions, or railway-highway crossings, pursuant to sections 130, 144, and 148 of this title or for the purpose of developing any highway safety construction improvement project which may be implemented utilizing Federal-aid highway funds shall not be subject to discovery or admitted into evidence in a Federal or State court proceeding or considered for other purposes in any action for damages arising from any occurrence at a location mentioned or addressed in such reports, surveys, schedules, lists, or data.

23 U.S.C. § 409. Federal courts have stated that section 409 excludes from evidence data compiled for purposes of highway and railroad crossing safety enhancement and construction for which a state receives federal funding, in order to facilitate candor in administrative evaluations of highway safety hazards and to prevent federally required record-keeping from being used for purposes of private litigation. *See Harrison v. Burlington N. R.R.*, 965 F.2d 155, 160 (7th Cir. 1992); *Robertson v. Union Pac. R.R.*, 954 F.2d 1433, 1435 (8th Cir. 1992); *see also Pierce County v. Guillen*, 537 U.S. 129 (2003) (upholding constitutionality of 23 U.S.C. § 409, relied on by county in denying request under state's Public Disclosure Act).

You state a portion of the submitted information is from the department's Pavement Management Information System and Pavement Analysis System (collectively "PAS"). You explain PAS information is used to diagnose pavement problems, which constitute a hazardous roadway condition. You assert the department uses this type of information to evaluate safety hazards and plan safety improvements of potential accident sites. Additionally, you inform us this information pertains to roadways that are part of the National Highway System under section 103 of title 23 of the United States Code and are, therefore, federal-aid highways for the purposes of section 409 of title 23. Accordingly, you assert the submitted information would be privileged from discovery in civil litigation under section 409 and is, therefore, excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Lecelle Clarke". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name being more prominent.

Lecelle Clarke  
Attorney  
Open Records Division

LC/eb

Ref: ID# 749110

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)