



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 18, 2019

Mr. Thomas Royce Hansen
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102-6311

OR2019-01696

Dear Mr. Hansen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 746739 (City PIR No. W077818).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified charge of discrimination number involving a named individual and specified entity. You state the city has released some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 21.305 of the Labor Code. You state the submitted information was compiled by the city's Human Relations Commission (the "unit") in the course of its investigation of an employment discrimination claim filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code. *See* Labor Code § 21.201 (person claiming to be aggrieved by unlawful employment practice or person's agent may file complaint with Texas Workforce Commission ("TWC")). You state the unit was created under chapter 21 of the Labor Code. *See id.* § 21.152 (providing for creation of local commissions). You also explain, pursuant to chapter 21, both the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and the TWC have deferred jurisdiction to hear complaints to the unit. *See id.* § 21.154 (authorizing deferral of jurisdiction to local

commissions); *see also* 40 T.A.C. § 819.76 (authorizing workshare agreements between the TWC and local commissions). Thus, under section 21.152 of the Labor Code, the unit is a local agency authorized to investigate and resolve complaints of employment discrimination. *See* Labor Code §§ 21.154 (authorizing local commission to which complaint is referred or jurisdiction is deferred to receive, investigate, conciliate, or rule on complaint), .204 (relating to investigation of complaints by the TWC). Section 21.304 of the Labor Code, which relates to public release of information obtained by the TWC, provides, “[a]n officer or employee of the [TWC] may not disclose to the public information obtained by the [TWC] under Section 21.204 except in compliance with Section 21.305 and as necessary to the conduct of a proceeding under this chapter.” *Id.* § 21.304. The submitted information pertains to a complaint of unlawful employment discrimination. You state the requestor is a party to the complaint filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code. Section 21.305 of the Labor Code concerns the release of records to a party to a complaint filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code and provides as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (c), the [TWC] shall adopt rules allowing a party to a complaint filed under Section 21.201 reasonable access to [TWC] records relating to the complaint.

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), unless the complaint is resolved through a voluntary settlement or conciliation, on the written request of a party the executive director shall allow the party access to the [TWC] records:

(1) after the final action of the [TWC]; or

(2) if a civil action relating to the complaint is filed in federal court alleging a violation of federal law.

(c) Notwithstanding Section 552.023, Government Code, the following information is not considered public information for the purposes of [the Act], and may not be disclosed to a party to a complaint filed under Section 21.201:

(1) identifying information of persons other than the parties and witnesses to the complaint;

(2) identifying information about confidential witnesses, including any confidential statement given by the witness;

(3) sensitive medical information about the charging party or a witness to the complaint that is:

(A) provided by a person other than the person requesting the information; and

(B) not relevant to issues raised in the complaint, including information that identifies injuries, impairments, pregnancies, disabilities, or other medical conditions that are not obviously apparent or visible;

(4) identifying information about a person other than the charging party that is found in sensitive medical information regardless of whether the information is relevant to the complaint;

(5) nonsensitive medical information that is relevant to the complaint if the disclosure would result in an invasion of personal privacy, unless the information is generally known or has been previously reported to the public;

(6) identifying information about other respondents or employers not a party to the complaint;

(7) information relating to settlement offers or conciliation agreements received from one party that was not conveyed to the other and information contained in a separate alternative dispute resolution file prepared for mediation purposes; and

(8) identifying information about a person on whose behalf a complaint was filed if the person has requested that the person's identity as a complaining party remain confidential.

(d) In this section, "identifying information" has the meaning assigned by Section 32.51, Penal Code.

Id. § 21.305. You state final agency action has been taken in this case. Further, you do not state the complaint was resolved through a voluntary settlement or conciliation agreement. Pursuant to section 21.305, the requestor generally has a right of access to the unit's records relating to the complaint. We note, however, subsection 21.305(c) identifies eight categories of information not considered public information for the purposes of the Act and which may not be disclosed to a party to a complaint filed under section 21.201. *Id.* § 21.305(c). Upon review, we find section 21.305(c) is applicable to the information the city marked.

Accordingly, the city must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.305(c) of the Labor Code.¹

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.² Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we find the marked motor vehicle record information is generally confidential under section 552.130. However, we note, in this instance, the requestor has a statutory right of access to the requested information.

A specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. Open Records Decision No. 451 at 4 (1986). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Accordingly, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 21.305 of the Labor Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 21.305 generally applies to any type of record contained in unit complaint records. Section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we conclude section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided under section 21.305 of the Labor Code. We therefore conclude, notwithstanding section 21.305, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information it marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.305(c) of the Labor Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor pursuant to section 21.305(b) of the Labor Code.³

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³As discussed above, the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released. *See* Lab. Code § 21.305(b). If the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the city should again seek a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "C" and a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/mo

Ref: ID# 746739

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)