



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 15, 2019

Ms. April R. Philley
Counsel for Arlington Independent School District
Eichelbaum Wardell Hansen Powell & Mehl, P.C.
5801 Tennyson Parkway, Suite 360
Plano, Texas 75024

OR2019-01274

Dear Ms. Philley:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 746070 (PIA Request #72).

The Arlington Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a former district employee.¹ You state the district has released some information. You state the district has redacted information pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code.² Further, the district states it will withhold information under sections

¹We note the district sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

²The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. The DOE has determined that FERPA determinations must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education records. We have posted a copy of the letter from the DOE to this office on the Attorney General's website: <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/sites/default/files/files/divisions/open-government/20060725-USDOE-FERPA.pdf>

552.024, 552.130(c), and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).³ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.102 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides, in relevant part, “[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential.” Educ. Code § 21.355(a). This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or administrator. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we determined for purposes of section 21.355, the word “teacher” means a person who is required to and does in fact hold a teaching certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code and who is in the process of teaching, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.* at 4. We further determined “teacher interns, teacher trainees, librarians, educational aids and counselors cannot be teachers or administrators for purposes of section 21.355.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 5 (2009).

You state the information you marked is subject to section 21.355 of the Education Code. Upon review, we agree the information you marked consists of evaluations of a teacher as contemplated by section 21.355 of the Education Code. You state the teacher held the appropriate certificates. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

³Section 552.024(c)(2) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact information protected by section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act if the current or former employee or official to whom the information pertains timely chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.024(c)(2). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with subsections 552.024(c-1) and (c-2). *See id.* § 552.024(c)(1)-(c)(2). Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See id.* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including a Form I-9 and attachments under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and a W-4 form under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information you marked consists of a report of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect made to the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “a transcript from an institution of higher education maintained in the personnel file of a professional public school employee[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(b). This exception further provides, however, that “the degree obtained or the curriculum on a transcript in the personnel file of the employee” are not excepted from disclosure. *Id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the college transcripts you marked under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. The district must withhold the

information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The district must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the college transcripts you marked under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "D. Michelle Case", followed by a horizontal flourish.

D. Michelle Case
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DMC/gw

Ref: ID# 746070

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)