



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 15, 2019

Ms. Linda Pemberton
Paralegal
City of Killeen
P.O. Box 1329
Killeen, Texas 76540

OR2019-01182

Dear Ms. Pemberton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 746285 (ORR No. W027071).

The Killeen Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to the requestor and a specified address during a specified time period.¹ You state the department released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note report number K17079674 involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides, "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and telecommunication identifying information or access device. *Id.*

¹You state the department sought and received clarification of the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (providing that if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-day period to request attorney general ruling is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

§ 32.51(a)(1)(A), (D). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, report number K17079674 pertains to a report of fraudulent use of identifying information, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. Additionally, the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. However, we are unable to determine if the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim in the report at issue. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. If the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim, report number K17079674 is subject to article 2.29 and must be released to the requestor except to the extent it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. Although you seek to withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this exception does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Accordingly, if the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim, report number K17079674 may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.101 of the Government Code protects information made confidential under law. Therefore, to the extent the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to report number K17079674. If the requestor is not the authorized representative of the victim, article 2.29 does not apply to the information at issue.

and we will address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for report number K17079674.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state some of the submitted information pertains to concluded investigations that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation and our review, we find section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold the information we indicated under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by chapter 61 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which addresses intelligence information pertaining to street gangs. Article 61.02 provides, in part, “a criminal justice agency . . . shall compile criminal information into an intelligence database for the purpose of investigating or prosecuting the criminal activities of criminal combinations or criminal street gangs.” Crim. Proc. Code art. 61.02(a). Article 61.03 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) A criminal justice agency may release on request information maintained under [Chapter 61 of the Code of Criminal Procedure] to:

- (1) another criminal justice agency;
- (2) a court; or
- (3) a defendant in a criminal proceeding who is entitled to the discovery of the information under Chapter 39.

Id. art. 61.03(a). Further, article 61.05 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides release of this information to a person who is not entitled to the information is a Class A misdemeanor. *See id.* art. 61.05(b). You assert the information you marked is included in and maintained as part of an intelligence database and as prescribed by chapter 61 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information at issue was obtained from an intelligence database as prescribed by chapter 61 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 61.03 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the information at issue includes the requestor's date of birth. The requestor has a right of access to this information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). If the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim listed in report number K17079674, then the department must withhold the suspect's date of birth in that report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Further, the department must withhold the living public citizen's date of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We find portions of the remaining information consist of motor vehicle record information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, if the requestor is the authorized representative of the victim listed in report number K17079674, then, except for the suspect's date of birth, which must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, the department must release report number K17079674 in its entirety pursuant to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. With the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold the information we indicated under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 61.03 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/sb

Ref: ID# 746285

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)