



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 5, 2018

Mr. Gabriel A. Rodriguez
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Department
City of Corpus Christi
P.O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469-9277

OR2018-04925

Dear Mr. Rodriguez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 698980 (ORR# JBro7).

The Corpus Christi Police Department (the "department") received a request for report number 170526077. The department indicates it will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 (2016).¹ The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."² Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law physical safety exception. The Texas Supreme Court has recognized a separate common-law physical safety exception to required

¹Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 authorized the department to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

disclosure. *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Cox Tex. Newspapers, L.P. & Hearst Newspapers, L.L.C.*, 343 S.W.3d 112, 118 (Tex. 2011). Pursuant to this common-law physical safety exception, “information may be withheld [from public release] if disclosure would create a substantial threat of physical harm.” *Id.* In applying this new standard, the court noted “deference must be afforded” law enforcement experts regarding the probability of harm, but further cautioned, “vague assertions of risk will not carry the day.” *Id.* at 119.

The department informs us some of the submitted information, which it marked, relates to an undercover narcotics police officer or to an officer working in an undercover capacity. The department asserts release of the information would submit the undercover officer to a substantial threat of physical harm. Based on these representations, we agree release of the identity of undercover officer would create a substantial threat of physical harm to the officer at issue. Therefore, the department must withhold the identity of the undercover officer, which it marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception.³

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2–3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known). Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated release of any of the remaining information would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Accordingly, the

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address the department's argument under section 552.152 of the Government Code against its disclosure.

department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find none of the remaining information consists of motor vehicle record information for purposes of section 552.130. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the identity of the undercover officer, which it marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 698980

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)