



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 21, 2018

Ms. Jennifer Gonzales
Assistant District Attorney
Civil Division
Hays County Criminal District Attorney's Office
712 Stagecoach Trail, Suite 2057
San Marcos, Texas 78666

OR2018-04133

Dear Ms. Gonzales:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 696618 (ref # 17-1114).

The Hays County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information related to a specified case. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See id.* § 58.008(b). The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not involve a juvenile suspect, offender, or defendant engaging in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision for the purposes of section 58.008(b). Thus, the district attorney’s office may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency ... on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this

subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Id. § 261.201 (a), (k), (l)(1)-(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001 (1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code chapter 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. We note the requestor is a parent of two of the child victims listed in the information, and is not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the information at issue may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(1)(1) states any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness who is under 18 years of age and is not the child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(1). Thus, the district attorney’s office must withhold the identifying information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1) of the Family Code. In addition, section 261.201(1)(2) states that any information excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Therefore, we will consider whether the submitted information is otherwise excepted from disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540

S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor has a right of access to his own private information and his minor children's private information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, except for the requestor's date of birth and his children's dates of birth, the district attorney's office must withhold the identifiable public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note the remaining information at issue pertains to juvenile victims who have been de-identified pursuant to section 261.201(l)(1) of the Family Code and whose privacy interests are thus protected. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(1) of the Family Code. Except for the requestor's date of birth and his children's dates of birth, the district attorney's office must withhold the identifiable public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

¹We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released in this instance that is confidential with respect to the general public. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k); Gov't Code § 552.023(a). Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the district attorney's office receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the district attorney's office should again seek a ruling from this office.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Debbie K. Lee', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/som

Ref: ID# 696618

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)