



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 16, 2018

Mr. Matthew Grove
Assistant County Attorney
Fort Bend County Attorney's Office
401 Jackson Street, 3rd Floor
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2018-03793

Dear Mr. Grove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 696118.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to the requestor, a named individual, and two specified locations during a designated period of time. You state you will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency . . . on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue consists of reports of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect made to the sheriff's office. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. In this instance, the requestor is a parent of the child victims listed in the information at issue. However, the requestor is alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect in some of the information at issue. Thus, the

requestor does not have a right of access to the information at issue under 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold report numbers 16-34584 and 17-13356 in their entireties under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.² Nevertheless, the requestor is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect in report numbers 14-23709, 14-31990, 15-3211, and 16-25203. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), this may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* However, section 261.201(1)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments against disclosure for report numbers 14-23709, 14-31990, 15-3211, and 16-25203. Further, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of calls slip numbers P141890357 and P150310337 was used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under section 261.201(a)(2). Furthermore, you have not established this information is a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under section 261.201(a)(1). *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold calls slip numbers P141890357 and P150310337 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). The sheriff's office states report numbers 14-19155, 14-20808, 14-23364, 14-23709, 14-24646, 14-31990, 14-35950, 15-29710, 15-3211, 15-3540, 15-4248, and 16-25203 pertain to cases that concluded in results other than convictions or deferred adjudications. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold report numbers 14-19155, 14-20808, 14-23364, 14-23709, 14-24646, 14-31990, 14-35950, 15-29710, 15-3211, 15-3540, 15-4248, and 16-25203 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor has a right of access to her private information that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("a person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to a person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold the requestor's private information under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy. However, upon review, we find portions of the remaining information satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.³ Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. See *id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold report numbers 16-34584 and 17-13356 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold report numbers 14-19155, 14-20808, 14-23364, 14-23709, 14-24646, 14-31990, 14-35950, 15-29710, 15-3211, 15-3540, 15-4248, and 16-25203 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's must release the remaining information.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahanna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/tdw

Ref: ID# 696118

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note some of the information being released in this instance includes information that is confidential with respect to the general public. See Fam. Code § 261.201(k); Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the sheriff's office receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the sheriff's office should again seek a ruling from this office.