



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 13, 2018

Mr. Mark C. Kratovil  
Assistant Criminal District Attorney  
Tarrant County  
401 West Belknap, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Fort Worth, Texas 76196-0201

OR2018-03413

Dear Mr. Kratovil:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 695683.

The Tarrant County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for the entire file of a specified case. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.111 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a grand jury subpoena. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). Thus, to the extent the district attorney's office holds the information at issue as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the district attorney's office is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. To the extent the district attorney's office does not hold the information at issue as an agent of the grand jury, we will address your arguments against its disclosure.

Next, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of a completed investigation that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The district attorney's office must release the submitted information pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Although you raise section 552.111 of the Government Code for the submitted information, we note section 552.111 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 677 (2002) (governmental body may waive attorney work product privilege under section 552.111), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (governmental body may waive section 552.111). As such, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.111. The attorney work product privilege, which is encompassed by section 552.111, is also found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure. The Texas Supreme Court has held "[t]he Texas Rules of Civil Procedure and Texas Rules of Evidence are 'other law' within the meaning of section 552.022." *In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). We note, however, the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure apply only to "actions of a civil nature." *See* TEX. R. CIV. P. 2. Thus, because the information at issue relates to a criminal case, the attorney work product privilege found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure does not apply, and this information may not be withheld on that basis. However, because section 552.136 makes information confidential under the Act, we will address your assertion of that exception for the submitted information. Additionally, because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.137 can make information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the information at issue.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked and all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); see *id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy and group numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the group numbers, and the bank account and routing numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, the check numbers you marked do not consist of access device numbers and may not be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). See *id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not within the scope of section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their release.

In summary, to the extent the district attorney's office holds the grand jury subpoena as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the district attorney's office is not required to release

that information in response to the instant request. The district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked and all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the group number, and the bank account and routing numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their release. The district attorney's office must release the remaining information.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



D. Michelle Case  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DMC/gw

Ref: ID# 695683

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the remaining information includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).