



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 12, 2018

Mr. Mark E. Dempsey
Assistant City Attorney
City of Garland
P.O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2018-03242

Dear Mr. Dempsey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 694872 (GCA 17-0749).

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received three requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to three specified arrests of a named individual. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains court-filed documents that are subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which provides the following:

Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The department seeks to withhold some of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Austin Chronicle Corp. v. City of Austin*, No. 03-08-00596-CV, 2009 WL 483232 (Tex. App.—Austin Feb. 24, 2009, no pet.) (mem. op., not designated for publication); *see also Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn*, 420 U.S. 469, 496 (1975) (action for invasion of privacy cannot be maintained where information is in public domain); *Star-Telegram, Inc. v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54, 57 (Tex. 1992) (law cannot recall information once in public domain). Therefore, the department may not withhold information contained in the court-filed documents under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we will address the department's arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the federal government or other states. *See Open Records Decision No. 565* (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code § 411.083.* Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we agree some of the information you marked consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. However, we find the department failed to demonstrate portions of the information you marked consist of CHRI for purposes of section 411.083. This information, which we marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied). (mem. op.). Upon review, we agree some of the information the department marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we find the department has not demonstrated portions of the information it marked are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. This information, which we marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked within the documents not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we find the department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked within the documents not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information

you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham
Attorney
Open Records Division

JMG/eb

Ref: ID# 694872

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)