



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 31, 2018

Ms. Ileana Fernandez
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2018-02143

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 693983.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state you will release some information. You state the department will redact some information pursuant to Open Records Letter Nos. 2012-07334 (2012) and 2015-24970 (2015).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record." Transp. Code § 730.004.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 authorizes the department to withhold Federal Bureau of Investigation numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law without requesting a ruling from this office. Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 authorizes the department to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the department is an agency for purposes of chapter 730 that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. Accordingly, the information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 730.004 of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Additionally, a compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov’t Code* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find most of the information you marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, except where we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we agree the department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, except where we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/gw

Ref: ID# 693983

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)