



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 25, 2018

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2018-01707

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 692878 (City File No. 17-1026-8954).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to two specified case numbers involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Further, the Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.).

Upon review, we find some of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. We note the requestor may be the authorized representative of one of the individuals whose privacy interests are at issue. In that case, the requestor has a special right of access to information related to this individual that would otherwise be protected under common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Therefore, to the extent the requestor is the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the department may not withhold the marked information or the individual at issue's date of birth from this requestor under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Conversely, to the extent the requestor is not the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the department must withhold the information we have marked and the individual at issue's date of birth under 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. In either event, the department must withhold the remaining public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison

Assistant Attorney General

Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 692878

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)