



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 17, 2018

Ms. DeAndrea Bradford
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Division
Arlington Police Department
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2018-00994

Dear Ms. Bradford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 692550 (ORR# 47482).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for two specified incident reports involving a named individual. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹We note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.301(e). Nonetheless, because the exception the department claims can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider its applicability to the submitted information. See *id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We understand the department to assert the submitted information is subject to section 58.008(b).² Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We note section 58.008(b) applies only to law enforcement records that involve a juvenile as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Section 58.008(b) does not apply to law enforcement records that relate to a juvenile only as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party. The department argues the submitted information falls within the scope of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Upon review, we find the submitted information does not list a juvenile as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Thus, the department has not demonstrated the submitted information involves juvenile conduct for purposes of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

²Although the department argues the information at issue is made confidential by section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, we note the 85th Legislature repealed this provision effective September 1, 2017. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 21, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Report number 07-6574 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find report number 07-6574 is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold report number 07-6574 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

However, we note the requestor is an investigator for the Texas Medical Board (the “board”). Section 153.006(a) of the Occupations Code constitutes applicable state law and provides “[t]he board may receive criminal record reports from any law enforcement agency or another source regarding a license holder or license applicant.” Occ. Code § 153.006(a). In this instance, the board seeks access to criminal records pertaining to a license holder. Thus, if the department determines the release of report number 07-6574 would not be for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the board does not have a right of access to this information and the department must withhold report number 07-6574 in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the release of report number 07-6574 would be for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department generally must release the information to the board pursuant to section 153.006(a). In that instance, we will consider additional exceptions to disclosure of report number 07-6574, as well as report number 08-86131.

We note portions of the submitted reports consist of motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.³ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, we find the department must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided by section 153.006 of the Occupations Code. A statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(b) (information described by section 552.130(a) may only be released in manner authorized by chapter 730 of Transportation Code). Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision, unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See id.* § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Although section 153.006 provides the board access to criminal record reports regarding a license holder or license applicant, section 552.130 of the Government Code specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Furthermore, section 552.130 of the Government Code was enacted later than section 153.006. *See* Act of Aug. 5, 1981, 67th Leg., 1st C.S., ch. 1, § 1, 1981 Tex. Gen. Laws 1, 7 (enacting statutory predecessor to section 153.006); Act of June 20, 1997, 75th Leg., R.S., ch. 1187 § 4, 1997 Tex. Gen. Laws 4575, 4580 (enacting section 552.130). We therefore conclude, notwithstanding section 153.006, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the department determines the release of report number 07-6574 would not be for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold report number 07-6574 in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked within report number 08-86131, as well as within report number 07-6574 if the department determines the release of report number 07-6574 would be for purposes

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

consistent with the Family Code, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 692550

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. Thus, if the department receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a decision from this office.