



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 9, 2018

Ms. Judith N. Benton
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2018-00675

Dear Ms. Benton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 697793 (LGL 17-193).

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department has released some of the requested information. You claim some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; or

(4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d)-(e); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining "child" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). In this instance, however, the requestor is the parent of one of the juvenile offenders. As such, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning this juvenile pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d). However, section 58.008(e)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness to whom the requestor is not the authorized representative of must be redacted. *See id.*

§ 58.008(e)(1). Further, section 58.008(e)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider your arguments against disclosure of the submitted information.

We first address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code, as it is potentially the most encompassing. Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information the department marked relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based upon this representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You seek to withhold portions of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. As noted above, section 58.008(e)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor’s child must be redacted. Fam. Code § 58.008(e)(1). Accordingly, upon review, we find the department must withhold the identifying information of the other juveniles in the remaining information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. However, no portion of the remaining information contains identifying information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1).

The department asserts the dates of birth are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the information at issue includes the

requestor's date of birth. The requestor has a right of access to this information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining dates of birth you have marked pertain to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interests are, thus, protected. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. However, because the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.


In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to this requestor.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹We note the information being released contains a social security number subject to section 552.147 of the Government Code that does not belong to the requestor. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this officer under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). Because the requestor has a right of access to certain information that otherwise would be excepted from release under the Act, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/gw

Ref: ID# 697793

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)