



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 22, 2017

Ms. Dawn Bracket  
Counsel for the City of Murphy  
Messer, Rockefeller & Fort, PLLC  
6371 Preston Road, Suite 200  
Frisco, Texas 75034

OR2017-29168

Dear Ms. Bracket:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 694155 (ORR ID# M1113117HG).

The City of Murphy (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all information related to a specified citation. You state the city will redact information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public, under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. We note, however, the information at issue includes a citation. Because a copy of the citation was provided to the individual who was cited, we find release of the citation will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). We therefore conclude the citation may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). However, based on your representation and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information at issue.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Gov't Code* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note the basic information does not include dates of birth. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. However, we also note basic information includes the identity and description of the complainant. *See id.* Thus, with the exception of the basic information and citation, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Gov't Code* § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the date of birth in the submitted citation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated any of the basic information at issue is highly

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information and citation, which must be released, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the citation, the city must withhold the date of birth in the submitted citation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

TN/tdw

Ref: ID# 694155

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)