



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 18, 2017

Ms. Ileana Fernandez
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2017-28635

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 688094.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident.¹ You state the department will release some information. You also state the department will redact dates of birth not belonging to the requestor pursuant to the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015).² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides:

¹Additionally, the department informs us it sent the requestor a cost estimate of charges pursuant to section 552.2615 of the Government Code, and the requestor accepted the cost estimate. *See* Gov't Code § 552.2615.

²Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing it to withhold dates of birth of living individuals under 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.1396. The submitted information contains video recordings that were made by or at the direction of officers employed by the department and contains footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (“A person commits an offense if the person is intoxicated while operating a motor vehicle in a public place.”). Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold this some of information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993), 451 (1986). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under article 2.1396 prevails. Therefore, the department may not withhold the video recordings at issue, which we have indicated, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the requestor is entitled to receive a copy of the video recordings we have indicated pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Portions of the video recordings to which the requestor has access under article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure consist of CHRI subject to section 411.083 of the Government Code and motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided under sections 411.083 and 552.130 and the right of access provided under article 2.1396 for the video recordings at issue. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*,

34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Although section 411.083 generally pertains to CHRI generated by the NCIC or by the TCIC and section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context, article 2.1396 specifically provides access to certain video footage pertaining to stops or arrests on suspected violations of sections 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, and 49.08 of the Penal Code. Therefore, we find article 2.1396 is more specific than, and prevails over, the general confidentiality provided under section 411.083 and section 552.130. Additionally, we note article 2.1396 is the later enacted statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 311.025(a) (if statutes enacted at different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, statute latest in enactment prevails). Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the video recordings we have indicated under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 or under section 552.130 and the video recordings must be released pursuant to article 2.1396.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The department states the information it has marked and indicated relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, the department may withhold the information you have marked and indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.130 of the Government Code for portions of the remaining information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Upon review, we agree the department may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the video recordings we have indicated pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The department may withhold the information you have marked and indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/sb

Ref: ID# 688094

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)