



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 18, 2017

Ms. L. Carolyn Nivens  
Counsel for the City of Seabrook  
Ross, Banks, May, Cron & Cavin, P.C.  
7700 San Felipe, Suite 550  
Houston, Texas 77063

OR2017-28618

Dear Ms. Nivens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 688350.

The City of Seabrook (the "city"), which you represent, received two requests for bid tabulations pertaining to a specified bid. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.104 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Further, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of JTR Constructors, Inc.; T&C Construction, Ltd.; Matula & Matula Construction, Inc.; R&B Group Inc.; and R.P. Constructors, Inc. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the third parties of the request for information and of their rights to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you also raise sections 552.101, 552.110, 552.113, and 552.131 for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these exceptions are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these exceptions. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this ruling, we have not received comments from any of the third parties. Thus, we have no basis to conclude a third party has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110(a)-(b); Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest a third party may have in the information.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder." Gov't Code § 552.104(a). The "test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder's [or competitor's information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage." *Id.* at 841. You argue release of the submitted information would provide future bidders information to undercut contractors and provide advantage to competitors. However, such an interest in protecting the information belongs to the third parties and not the city. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

EK/tdw

Ref: ID# 688350

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)

5 Third Parties  
(w/o enclosures)