



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 15, 2017

Ms. Dawn Roberts
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Division
City of Arlington
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2017-28513

Dear Ms. Roberts:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 688085 (ORR Nos. 45440 & 45441).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for all records pertaining to either of two named individuals. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; or

(4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We understand the department to assert the submitted information is subject to section 58.008(b).² Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Report numbers 06-28022, 06-22124, 06-6184, 05-59135, 01-28884, and 01-21513 involve juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply to report numbers 01-28884 and 01-21513. Accordingly, the department must withhold report numbers 01-28884 and 01-21513 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.³

In this instance, however, the requestor submitted signed consent for release of report numbers 06-28022, 06-22124, 06-6184, and 05-59135 from the named individual, who is one of the juvenile offenders at issue in these reports. Thus, the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the named individual and has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning him pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d). However, section 58.008(e)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor’s child must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the named individual, which we have marked within report numbers 06-28022, 06-6184, and 05-59135, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. Further, section 58.008(e)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider additional exceptions to disclosure of report numbers 06-28022, 06-22124, 06-6184, and 05-59135.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

²Although the department argues the information at issue is made confidential by section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, we note the 85th Legislature repealed this provision effective September 1, 2017. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 21, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187.

³We note the requestor has a right of access to this information at issue pursuant to section 261.201(k) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k); *but see id.* § 261.201(l)(2).

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). Report numbers 06-22124 and 05-59135 were used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes

of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold report number 06-22124 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

However, we note the requestor is a mitigation specialist from the Office of the Regional Public Defender for Capital Cases (the “public defender’s office”). Section 261.201 provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.1272 of the Government Code provides:

The office of capital and forensic writs and a public defender’s office are entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated . . . by the public defender’s office has been appointed.

Gov’t Code § 411.1272. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the information at issue contains CHRI pertaining to the requestor’s client.

Accordingly, the requestor is authorized to obtain the CHRI at issue from the department pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code if it relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed, but only for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(a);

Gov't Code §§ 411.1272, .087(a)(2). Accordingly, if the department determines report number 06-22124 relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed and if release of CHRI is for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI pertaining to the named individual in report number 06-22124 pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code. If the department determines report number 06-22124 does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed or if release of CHRI is not for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must not release the CHRI at issue.

We note the requestor is acting as an authorized representative of a child victim listed in report number 05-59135. Further, the requestor is not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), report number 05-59135 may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will also consider additional exceptions to disclosure of report number 05-59135.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold report numbers 01-28884 and 01-21513 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the named individual, which we marked within report numbers 06-28022, 06-6184, and 05-59135, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. The department must generally withhold report number 06-22124 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code; however, if the department determines report number 06-22124 relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed and if release of CHRI is for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI pertaining to the named individual in report number 06-22124 pursuant to


⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 688085

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁵We note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, if the department receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a decision from this office.