



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 13, 2017

Mr. Ryan D. Pittman
Counsel for the City of Frisco
Abernathy, Roeder, Boyd & Hullett, P.C.
1700 Redbud Boulevard, Suite 300
McKinney, Texas 75069-3276

OR2017-28322

Dear Mr. Pittman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 687860 (Ref. No. G021900-092017).

The City of Frisco (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for blueprints of a specified address. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ You also state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of a third party. Accordingly, you state, and submit documentation showing, you notified Jones & Carter, Inc. ("Jones"), of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments stating why its information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure.

¹We note we asked the city to provide additional information pursuant to section 552.303 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.303(c)-(d) (if attorney general determines information in addition to that required by section 552.301 is necessary to render decision, written notice of that fact shall be given to governmental body and requestor, and governmental body shall submit necessary additional information to attorney general not later than seventh calendar day after date of receipt of notice).

See Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Jones explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Jones has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. See *id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Jones may have in the information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by other statutes. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act, sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make confidential certain information related to terrorism. You assert the submitted information is made confidential by sections 418.181 and 418.182 of the Government Code. Section 418.181 provides,

Those documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism.

Id. § 418.181. Section 418.182 provides, in relevant part,

(a) Except as provided by Subsections (b) and (c), information, including access codes and passwords, in the possession of a governmental entity that relates to the specifications, operating procedures, or location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity is confidential.

Id. § 418.182(a). The fact that information may relate to a governmental body's security concerns does not make the information *per se* confidential under the Texas Homeland Security Act. See Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the Texas Homeland Security Act must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You seek to withhold the submitted information under sections 418.181 and 418.182. You state the information "identifies particular vulnerabilities and strong and weak points in the

design of” a critical infrastructure in the city. You state this information is vital to the city’s security and operations, which the city must maintain as confidential to protect and defend the city’s citizens and others located near critical infrastructure. You inform us the submitted site plans reveal the location of existing city water, sewage, and draining lines, which are critical infrastructure. *See generally id.* § 421.001(2) (defining “critical infrastructure” to include “all public or private assets, systems, and functions vital to the security, governance, public health and safety, economy, or morale of the state or nation”). Based on your representations and our review, we find the information we have marked reveals the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code.²

However, you have not demonstrated the remaining information identifies the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. Moreover, you have not demonstrated the information at issue consists of access codes and passwords or reveals the location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. Consequently, we find the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 or section 418.182 of the Government Code. As no other exceptions to disclosure are raised, the city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Meredith L. Coffman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MLC/tdw

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Ref: ID# 687860

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Third Party
(w/o enclosures)