



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 13, 2017

Mr. Brandon S. Shelby
City Attorney
City of Sherman
P.O. Box 1106
Sherman, Texas 75091

OR2017-28314

Dear Mr. Shelby:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 687821 (OR-2998; SPD# 166).

The Sherman Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a named individual and a specified license plate number. You state the department has released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and

¹Although you also raise section 552.103 of the Government Code, you have provided no arguments explaining how this exception is applicable to the submitted information. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert this exception. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(A), .302. Further, although you also cite section 552.108(5)(e) of the Government Code as an exception to disclosure, we note this section does not exist. Based on the substance of your argument, we understand you to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code.

(2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, and thus, implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and the department may not withhold the information at issue as such under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note case number 07-0004224 was used or developed in an investigation by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of section 261.201). Thus, the information at issue is within the scope of section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. There is no indication the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Accordingly, the department must withhold case number 07-0004224 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000. We understand the department is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. You seek to withhold information pertaining to 9-1-1 callers within the submitted documents. Upon review, we conclude, to the extent the telephone numbers and addresses within the remaining information were furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. However, if the information at issue was not furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, then the department may not withhold this information under section 552.101 on the basis of section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Nevertheless, you have not demonstrated the remaining information consists of the originating telephone number or address of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. Consequently, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold case number 07-0004224 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. To the extent the telephone numbers and addresses within the remaining information were furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 687821

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)