



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 13, 2017

Mr. O. Charles Buenger
Counsel for City of Mart
Buenger & Associates
3203 Robinson Drive
Waco, Texas 76706

OR2017-28256

Dear Mr. Buenger:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 687811.

The Mart Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find the submitted information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. However, we note the requestor, who is not alleged to have committed the abuse, may be a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim named in the information at issue. As we are unable to make this determination based on the information submitted, we must rule conditionally. If the department determines the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the submitted information must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the submitted information may not

be withheld on the basis of section 261.201(a).¹ *See id.* § 261.201(k). We also note section 261.201(l)(2) states that any information excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Thus, we will consider your remaining arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Next, we note the submitted information includes search warrants, which are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record[,]” unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver).* Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we have marked, under section 552.108. You further seek to withhold the marked court-filed documents under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992). Therefore, no portion of the submitted court-filed documents may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, as no other exceptions to disclosure are raised, the court-filed documents we have marked must be released pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. However, we will consider your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue relates to pending criminal prosecutions. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has held common-law privacy protects the identifying information of a juvenile victim of abuse or neglect. See Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); cf. Fam. Code § 261.201. Further, if the department determines the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the minor child at issue, then the requestor has a right of access to his minor child's private information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“[a] person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Therefore, we find you have not demonstrated the basic information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.


In summary, if the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, then, except for basic information and the information we marked subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

²We note the information being released in this instance includes information that is confidential with respect to the general public. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Fam. Code § 261.201(k); ORD 481. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the department should again seek a ruling from this office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/tdw

Ref: ID# 687811

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)