



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 7, 2017

Mr. Gary A. Scott
Assistant City Attorney
City of Conroe
P.O. Box 3066
Conroe, Texas 77305

OR2017-27817

Dear Mr. Scott:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 687129.

The City of Conroe (the "city") received a request for surveillance camera recording of the lobby of the city's animal shelter (the "shelter") for a specified period of time. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

Initially, we address the requestor's contention that information believed to be similar or identical to the submitted information has already been made public. The Act does not permit the selective disclosure of information. *See id.* §§ 552.007(b), .021; Open Records Decision No. 463 at 1-2 (1987). If information has been voluntarily released to any member of the public, then that exact same information may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007(a); Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential

by law). However, we note section 552.007 does not prohibit an agency from withholding similar types of information that are not the exact information that has been previously released. We note the requestor does not state the information released to the public is identical to the submitted information. Further, we have no indication the information at issue has been released in its exact form to any members of the public. Accordingly, we find section 552.007 of the Government Code is inapplicable to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 418.182 of the Texas Homeland Security Act (the “HSA”), chapter 418 of the Government Code. Section 418.182 provides, in relevant part:

(a) [I]nformation . . . in the possession of a governmental entity that relates to the specifications, operating procedures, or location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity is confidential.

Id. § 418.182(a). The fact information may be related to a security system does not make such information per se confidential under section 418.182. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute’s key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting section 418.182 must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

The submitted video recording consists of a security surveillance video recording from the shelter’s security system. You state the shelter’s security cameras are an integral part of the shelter’s security system. You also state the cameras are used to protect the shelter from acts of terrorism or other criminal activity. You assert release of the information at issue would reveal the specifications and locations of the cameras and threaten the security of the shelter. Further, you state release of the information at issue could be used to identify and exploit weakness in the shelter’s system. Upon review, we find the submitted surveillance video recording relates to the location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. *See Tex. Dep’t of Pub. Safety v. Abbott*, 310 S.W.3d 670 (Tex. App.—Austin 2010, no pet.) (finding confidential under section 418.182 of the HSA video recording containing images recorded by security cameras in Texas Capitol hallway because specifications of security system included cameras’ capabilities and video recording demonstrated those capabilities through characteristics, quality, and clarity of images recorded). Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.182 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahna Ward
Attorney
Open Records Division

JW/tdw

Ref: ID# 687129

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)