



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 6, 2017

Ms. P. Armstrong  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, 6W  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-27708

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 693478 (ORR# D001521).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified case. We understand you will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

<sup>2</sup>Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

<sup>3</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code with respect to the submitted information. Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. Additionally, you raise sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code for portions of the information at issue. Because these sections can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will also address your arguments under these sections for the information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), 301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information is related to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. You have provided documentation from the district attorney's office objecting to the release of the information at issue because release will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Based on the submitted representations and our review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) on behalf of the district attorney's office.<sup>4</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

---

<sup>4</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the dates of birth you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). The remaining information contains an employee identification number. We understand an employee identification number is the same number used for the City of Dallas credit union accounts plus one additional number. Thus, the department must withhold the employee identification number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department: (1) may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) on behalf of the district attorney's office; (2) must withhold the dates of birth you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code; (4) must withhold the employee identification number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code; and (5) must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tim Neal". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Tim" being more prominent than the last name "Neal".

Tim Neal  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

TN/tdw

Ref: ID# 693478

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)