



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 5, 2017

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2017-27606

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 686967 (Case #17-1026-8857).

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for internal affairs reports pertaining to a specified police involved shooting. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides that with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report the Office of the Attorney General ("OAG") determines is privileged, the OAG shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). The format of the report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18(b). Although the city claims the submitted

¹Although the city also raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, the city provides no arguments explaining how these doctrines apply to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume the city no longer asserts these doctrines. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

custodial death report is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Therefore, the city must release the submitted custodial death report pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime if release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note a portion of the submitted information consists of an internal affairs investigation. Section 552.108 is generally not applicable to purely administrative records that do not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.) (section 552.108 generally not applicable to law enforcement agency’s personnel records; *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). In this instance, you assert the information at issue pertains to an ongoing criminal prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186–87. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered basic information). Thus, with the exception of the submitted custodial death report, which must be released pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure, and the basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of the submitted information, except to note basic information may not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision No. 597 at 2-3 (1991)

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/gw

Ref: ID# 686967

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)