



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 17, 2017

Mr. Mack T. Harrison
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of State Health Services
P.O. Box 149347
Austin, Texas 78714-9347

OR2017-26339

Dear Mr. Harrison:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 684698 (DSHS File No. 27505).

The Texas Department of State Health Services (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified investigation.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code, which pertains to the disclosure of reports of abuse, neglect, or exploitation of elderly and disabled persons in certain facilities. Section 48.101 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

¹We note the department sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

(a) The following information is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]:

(1) a report of abuse, neglect, or exploitation made under this chapter;

(2) the identity of the person making the report; and

(3) except as provided by this section, all files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

(b) Confidential information may be disclosed only for a purpose consistent with this chapter and as provided by [the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (the "DFPS")] or investigating state agency rule and applicable federal law.

Hum. Res. Code § 48.101(a), (b). Section 48.051 of the Human Resources Code provides "a person having cause to believe that an elderly person, a person with a disability, or an individual receiving services from a provider as described by Subsection F [of chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code] is in the state of abuse, neglect, or exploitation" shall report certain prescribed information to the DFPS or another appropriate state agency. *See id.* § 48.051(a). The only entities authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code are DFPS and certain other state agencies, depending on the circumstances surrounding the incident. *See id.* §§ 48.151, .152, .252, .301. You inform us a portion of the submitted information consists of a DFPS abuse and neglect investigative report conducted under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code. Such information must not be released to the public, except for a purpose consistent with chapter 48 and as provided by DFPS or investigating state agency rule or federal law. *See id.* § 48.101(b). *But see id.* § 48.101(c)-(f) (permitting release of confidential information in certain circumstances). The department does not indicate, nor does it appear, an exception to confidentiality applies in this instance. Accordingly, we conclude the department must withhold the DFPS investigative report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential under section 161.032 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 161.032 addresses a broad category of medical committees and provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) The records and proceedings of a medical committee are confidential and are not subject to court subpoena.

...

(c) Records, information, or reports of a medical committee, medical peer review committee, or compliance officer and records, information, or reports provided by a medical committee, medical peer review committee, or compliance officer to the governing body of a public hospital, hospital district, or hospital authority are not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

...

(f) This section and Subchapter A, Chapter 160, Occupations Code, do not apply to records made or maintained in the regular course of business by a hospital, health maintenance organization, medical organization, university medical center or health science center, hospital district, hospital authority, or extended care facility.

Health & Safety Code § 161.032(a), (c), (f). A “medical committee” is any committee, including a joint committee of a hospital, medical organization, university medical school or health science center, health maintenance organization, extended care facility, a hospital district, or a hospital authority. *See id.* § 161.031(a). The term also encompasses “a committee appointed *ad hoc* to conduct a specific investigation or established under state or federal law or rule or under the bylaws or rules of the organization or institution.” *Id.* § 161.031(b) (emphasis added).

The precise scope of the “medical committee” provision has been the subject of a number of judicial decisions. *See, e.g., Memorial Hosp.—The Woodlands v. McCown*, 927 S.W.2d 1 (Tex. 1996); *Barnes v. Whittington*, 751 S.W.2d 493 (Tex. 1988); *Jordan v. Fourth Supreme Judicial Dist.*, 701 S.W.2d 644 (Tex. 1986). These cases establish that “documents generated by the committee in order to conduct open and thorough review” are confidential. This protection extends “to documents that have been prepared by or at the direction of the committee for committee purposes.” *Jordan*, 701 S.W.2d at 647-48. Protection does not extend to documents “gratuitously submitted to a committee” or “created without committee impetus and purpose.” *Id.* at 648; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 591 (1991) (construing, among other statutes, statutory predecessor to section 161.032).

Further, section 161.032 does not make confidential “records made or maintained in the regular course of business by a . . . university medical center or health science center[.]” Health & Safety Code § 161.032(f); *see also McCown*, 927 S.W.2d at 10 (stating reference to statutory predecessor to section 160.007 of the Occupations Code in section 161.032 of the Health and Safety Code is clear signal records should be accorded same treatment under both statutes in determining if they were made in ordinary course of business). The phrase “records made or maintained in the regular course of business” has been construed to mean records that are neither created nor obtained in connection with a medical committee’s deliberative proceedings. *See McCown*, 927 S.W.2d at 9-10.

You inform us the Rio Grande State Center’s Administrative Death Record Review Committee (the “committee”) was formed to conduct a root cause analysis, as required by

the Joint Commission accreditation standards, of the underlying incident. We note Rio Grande State Center is operated by the department. You state the remaining information consists of records of the committee and reports to the department's peer review committee for sentinel events. Upon review, we agree the committee is a "medical committee" for purposes of section 161.031. Further, we conclude the remaining information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 161.032 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Health & Safety Code § 161.031(a); *see also* *Jordan*, 701 S.W.2d at 648 (court found privilege extends to minutes of committee meetings, correspondence between members relating to deliberation process, and any final committee product).

In summary, the department must withhold the DFPS investigative report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code. The department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 161.032 of the Health and Safety Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahna Ward
Attorney
Open Records Division

JW/tdw

Ref: ID# 684698

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)