



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 13, 2017

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-25948

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 681976 (ORR# 2017-17588).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for the department's manpower reports as of a certain date. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.² We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

¹We note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Nevertheless, section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. Thus, we will consider the applicability of section 552.101 to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we address the requestor's contention that information believed to be similar to the submitted information has already been made public. The Act does not permit the selective disclosure of information. *See id.* §§ 552.007(b), .021; Open Records Decision No. 463 at 1-2 (1987). If information has been voluntarily released to any member of the public, then that exact same information may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See Gov't Code* § 552.007(a); Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). However, we note section 552.007 does not prohibit an agency from withholding similar types of information that are not the exact information that has been previously released. We note the requestor does not state the information released to the public is identical to the submitted information. Further, we have no indication the information at issue has been released in its exact form to any members of the public. Accordingly, we find section 552.007 of the Government Code is inapplicable to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 418.176 of the Government Code, which was added to chapter 418 of the Government Code as part of the Texas Homeland Security Act. Section 418.176 provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information is confidential if the information is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and:

(1) relates to staffing requirements of an emergency response provider, including a law enforcement agency, a fire-fighting agency, or an emergency services agency;

(2) relates to a tactical plan of the provider; or

(3) consists of a list or compilation of pager or telephone numbers, including mobile and cellular telephone numbers, of the provider.

Id. § 418.176(a). The fact that information may generally be related to emergency preparedness does not make the information *per se* confidential under section 418.176. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any confidentiality provision, a governmental body asserting section 418.176 must

adequately explain how the responsive information falls within the scope of the statute. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You argue the submitted information “pertains to the patrol staffing requirements and actual patrol staffing numbers for each of [the department’s] divisions for all watches.” You further state the “information is collected and maintained by [the department] for the purpose of properly preventing, detecting, responding to, and investigating terrorism and related criminal activity.” However, we note the submitted information consists of division manpower information and does not include information pertaining to actual patrol staffing or watch information. Thus, we conclude you have failed to demonstrate the submitted information fits within the confidentiality provisions of section 418.176. Consequently, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 418.176. As you raise no other exceptions to disclosure, the department must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 681976

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)