



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 23, 2017

Mr. Luke A. Cochran
Counsel for the City of Llano
Law Office of Cary L. Bovey, P.L.L.C.
2251 Double Creek Drive, Suite 204
Round Rock, Texas 78664

OR2017-24173

Dear Mr. Cochran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 681180.

The City of Llano (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to three named police officers.¹ You state you will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

¹You state the city sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information includes a search warrant that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17). This information must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022, which we marked, may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, as section 552.137 of the Government Code makes information confidential, we will consider the applicability of this section to the information subject to section 552.022.² We will also consider your argument under section 552.108 for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). In this instance, the submitted information consists of personnel file information for the named city police officers. We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to purely administrative records that do not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution). However, you state the remaining information pertains to an active criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable to the

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

remaining information. Thus, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). See Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the requestor has a right to his client’s e-mail address under section 552.137(b). *Id.* § 552.137(b). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, with the exception of the e-mail addresses belonging to the requestor’s client, the city must withhold any remaining personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to their public disclosure.

In summary, with the exception of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which must be released, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, with the exception of the e-mail addresses belonging to the requestor’s client, the city must withhold any remaining personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to their public disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Meagan J. Conway
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MC/sb

Ref: ID# 681180

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)