



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 18, 2017

Mr. Sharbel Sfeir
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2017-23907

Dear Mr. Sfeir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 680417 (TDCJ# ZT0057).

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to use of force incidents involving three named officers. You state you made some information available to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.134(a) of the Government Code relates to inmates of the department and provides the following:

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029, which provides, in relevant part, the following:

Notwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, the legislature explicitly made section 552.134 subject to section 552.029. The department contends the submitted information falls within the scope of section 552.134. We note most of the submitted information pertains to the conduct of department employees. Such information does not constitute “information about an inmate” for purposes of section 552.134 and may not be withheld on that basis. However, we find some of the submitted information, which we marked, pertains to inmates confined in a facility operated by the department and subject to section 552.134. We note this information pertains to an alleged crime involving an inmate. Therefore, the department must release basic information regarding the alleged crime pursuant to section 552.029(8). *See id.* For purposes of section 552.029(8), basic information includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and department employees who were directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we marked, constitutes a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by someone under the supervision of a physician. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information at issue, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. However, upon review, we find none of the remaining information constitutes medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if . . . release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(b)(1). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). To prevail on its claim that subsection 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a governmental body must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. Instead, the governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See* Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990) (construing statutory predecessor). This office has concluded

that section 552.108(b) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (1989) (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

The department explains the submitted video recordings contain “videographic details of the internal design and layout of one of [its] facilities.” The department also states the video recordings at issue reveal “movements of correctional officers and inmate, the layout of the facility, and critically – blind spots hidden from the view of the camera.” The department argues release of this information would allow a viewer to watch for patterns in security activity that might be exploited and could be used to compromise the safety and security of department staff. Based on these arguments and our review, we agree the release of the submitted video recordings would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the submitted video recordings under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address and telephone number, social security number, emergency contact information, and family member information of current or former employees of the department or any division of the department regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code.² Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(3). Accordingly, the department must withhold the social security numbers of current or former employees in the remaining information under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently, and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Portions of the remaining information depict the partially unclothed body of an identifiable individual. We find this individual has a constitutional right to the privacy of this information that outweighs any public interest in its release. Therefore, the department must withhold the information at issue, which we marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we conclude the information we marked meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The department may withhold the submitted video recordings under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the social security numbers of peace officers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'April Philley', written in a cursive style.

April Philley
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AP/sb

Ref: ID# 680417

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)