



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 13, 2017

Mr. Gary Allmon Grimes
Counsel for the Mesquite Independent School District
Schuereberg & Grimes
120 West Main, Suite 201
Mesquite, Texas 75149

OR2017-23433

Dear Mr. Grimes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 680139 (ORR# R001068-072617).

The Mesquite Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.130, 552.137, and 552.147 of the Government Code. You also state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the named individual of the request for information and of his right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have received comments from the named individual. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, which provides that an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form under the Act would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we

conclude the I-9 form you indicated is confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, and the district must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. Prior decisions of this office have held section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code renders federal tax return information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term “return information” as “a taxpayer’s identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Treasury] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]” *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term “return information” expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer’s liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff’d in part*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). Thus, the submitted W-4 form, which you indicated, constitutes tax return information that is confidential under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides that “[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].” Act of May 16, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S. . This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or an administrator. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). Additionally, a court has concluded that a written reprimand constitutes an evaluation for purposes of section 21.355, as it “reflects the principal’s judgment regarding [a teacher’s] actions, gives corrective direction, and provides for further review.” *Abbott v. North East Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 212 S.W.3d 364 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we concluded that a “teacher” for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who (1) is required to and does in fact hold a certificate or permit required under chapter 21 of the Education Code and (2) is teaching at the time of his or her evaluation. *See* ORD 643.

You assert a portion of information at issue is confidential under section 21.355. You inform us, and provide documentation showing, the substitute teacher at issue held the appropriate certification under chapter 21 of the Education Code at the time of the incident. Based on your representations and our review, we agree that some of the documents, which we have

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

marked, constitute evaluations as contemplated by section 21.355. Accordingly, the district must withhold the documents we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. However, you have not demonstrated that any of the remaining information at issue evaluates the performance of a teacher for purposes of section 21.355; thus, none of the remaining information at issue may be withheld on that basis under section 552.101.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure higher education transcripts of professional public school employees, but does not except the employee’s name, the courses taken, and the degree obtained from disclosure. Gov’t Code § 552.102(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted transcripts pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.117(a)(1), .024(a-1). Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, “A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee’s or former employee’s social security number. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be confidential under section 552.024. Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information.

Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. You inform us the named individual timely elected to keep his information confidential. Therefore, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c) of the Government Code. Accordingly, the district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail address affirmatively consents to its disclosure.

Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "[t]he social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential." *Id.* § 552.147(a-1). Thus, section 552.147(a-1) makes the social security numbers of school district employees confidential, without such employees being required to first make a confidentiality election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1) (school district may not require employee or former employee of district to choose whether to allow public access to employee's or former employee's social security number). Reading sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) together, we conclude section 552.147(a-1) makes confidential the social security numbers of both current and former school district employees. Therefore, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.³

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

In summary, the district must withhold the I-9 form you indicated pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the submitted W-4 form, which you indicated pursuant to section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the documents we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted transcripts pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail address affirmatively consents to its disclosure. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Buchanan
Attorney
Open Records Division

EB/eb

Ref: ID# 680139

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Third Party
(w/o enclosures)