



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 29, 2017

Mr. Darrell G-M Noga
Counsel for City of Coppell
Cantey Hanger, L.L.P.
1999 Bryan Street, Suite 3300
Dallas, Texas 75201-6822

OR2017-22321

Dear Mr. Noga:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 677567 (City No. W0002756-071017).

The City of Coppell (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified citation. You state you will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes city police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; or

(4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e)(2)); *see* Fam. Code § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code); Act of May 19, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1488, § 7.002 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)); Act of May 30, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., H.B. 29, § 21 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03(b) (defining "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining "child" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We understand the city to argue the submitted information is subject to section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.¹ Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). In this instance, however, the requestor is the legal representative of a parent of one of the juvenile offenders. As such, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning this juvenile pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(d)). Section 58.008(e)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(e)(2)). Thus, we will consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

¹Although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, we note the 85th Legislature repealed this provision effective September 1, 2017. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746 (S.B. 1304), § 21.

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information pertaining to incident number 17018503 was used or developed in an investigation by the city's police department of alleged child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). You have not indicated the city's police department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information pertaining to incident number 17018503 is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the city must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.005 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(a) This section applies only to the inspection, copying, and maintenance of a record concerning a child and to the storage of information from which a record could be generated, including personally identifiable information, information obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment of the child or for making a referral for treatment of the child, and other records or information, created by or in the possession of:

- (1) the Texas Juvenile Justice Department;
- (2) an entity having custody of the child under a contract with the Texas Juvenile Justice Department; or
- (3) another public or private agency or institution having custody of the child under order of the juvenile court, including a facility

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

operated by or under contract with a juvenile board or juvenile probation department.

(a-1) Except as provided by Article 15.27, Code of Criminal Procedure, the records and information to which this section applies may be disclosed only to:

- (1) the professional staff or consultants of the agency or institution;
- (2) the judge, probation officers, and professional staff or consultants of the juvenile court;
- (3) an attorney for the child;
- (4) a governmental agency if the disclosure is required or authorized by law;
- (5) a person or entity to whom the child is referred for treatment or services if the agency or institution disclosing the information has entered into a written confidentiality agreement with the person or entity regarding the protection of the disclosed information;
- (6) the Texas Department of Criminal Justice and the Texas Juvenile Justice Department for the purpose of maintaining statistical records of recidivism and for diagnosis and classification; or
- (7) with permission from the juvenile court, any other person, agency, or institution having a legitimate interest in the proceeding or in the work of the court.

Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 9 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 58.005(a), (a-1)). Information subject to section 58.005(a) may only be disclosed to certain listed individuals. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 9 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 58.005(a-1)). The city does not inform us, and the submitted information does not itself reflect, that any of this information was “obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment of the child or for making a referral for treatment of the child” by one of the listed entities. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 9 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 58.005(a)). Further, the city does not inform us, and the submitted information does not reflect, the information at issue consists of records created by or in the possession of any of the listed entities. We therefore conclude none of the remaining information is confidential pursuant to section 58.005 of the Family Code and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information pertaining to incident numbers 17018265 and 17018556 relate to ongoing investigations, and release of that information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the cases. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information pertaining to incident numbers 17018265 and 17018556 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include the identities of victims, witness, or other involved parties, but does include the identities of complainants. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Further, we note while basic information does include the identity of an arrestee, it does not include the identity of a suspect or motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See id.* Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the information pertaining to incident numbers 17018265 and 17018556 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The city must withhold the information pertaining to incident number 17018503 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the information pertaining to incident numbers 17018265 and 17018556 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

³We note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released in this instance. If the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(d)).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Erin Groff". The signature is fluid and cursive, written in a professional style.

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/sb

Ref: ID# 677567

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)