



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 27, 2017

Ms. Delietrice Henry
Open Records Assistant
City of Plano
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2017-22142

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 677382 (ORR# HOLL071117).

The City of Plano (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address from a specified time period and information pertaining to two named individuals. You state you released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683.

A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States*

Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request, in part, requires the city to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individuals named in the request, thus implicating the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting any of the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted reports that do not depict either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, this information is not part of a criminal history compilation protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. Therefore, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(b)). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred

before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least ten years old and less than seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We note some of the information at issue relates to a traffic offense. Section 58.008 does not make information related to traffic offense confidential. *See id.* § 51.02(16) (defining traffic offense); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (delinquent conduct for purposes of title 3 of Family Code does not include traffic offenses); Act of May 19, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1488, § 7.002 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)); Act of May 30, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., H.B. 29, § 21 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)) (conduct indicating a need for supervision does not include traffic offense). Therefore, we find you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code to this information and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.008(b). We find the information we marked involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply; therefore, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information relates to closed criminal cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on your representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting any of the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any


¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/bw

Ref: ID# 677382

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)