



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 20, 2017

Mr. Rashaad Gambrell
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2017-21564

Dear Mr. Gambrell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 679868 (ORR# 24505).

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to the city's acquisition of a specified property, including purchase agreements, appraisals, correspondence, site renderings, surveys, presentations, and timing documents. The city claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the city claims and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, the requestor claims the requested information has been previously released to the public. The Act does not permit the selective disclosure of information to the public. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.007(b), .021; Open Records Decision No. 463 at 1-2 (1987). Information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007(a); Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988). Accordingly, the city may not withhold previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. Section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may

be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). As such, section 552.103 neither prohibits public disclosure of information nor makes information confidential under law. Therefore, if the city previously released any portion of the submitted information to the public, such information may not now be withheld under section 552.103. However, to the extent the city has not previously released the submitted information, we will consider the applicability of section 552.103 to the information at issue.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body claiming section 552.103 has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents sufficient to establish the applicability of section 552.103 to the information it seeks to withhold. To meet this burden, the governmental body must demonstrate: (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date of its receipt of the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *See Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Both elements of the test must be met in order for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990).

The city states, and provides documentation demonstrating, prior to its receipt of the instant request, a Petition in Condemnation of the subject property was filed in the 295th District Court of Harris County, Texas in a lawsuit styled *City of Houston v. Kim A. Iglesia*, Cause No. 2017-46364. The city informs us the lawsuit is still pending. Therefore, we agree litigation was pending on the date the city received the present request for information. The city also states the submitted information pertains to the substance of the lawsuit claims. Based on these representations and our review, we find the information at issue is related to

the pending litigation. Therefore, we conclude the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to all parties to the pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

In summary, to the extent the city has not previously released the submitted information to the public, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. The city must release any remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/bw

Ref: ID# 679868

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)