



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 20, 2017

Ms. Brittany Tate
Executive Assistant
Buda Police Department
P.O. Box 1380
Buda, Texas 78610

OR2017-21545

Dear Ms. Tate:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 676235.

The Buda Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides the following:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

(1) the date and approximate time of the recording;

¹Although the department also claims section 552.103, it makes no argument under this exception. Therefore, we assume the department has withdrawn its claim this section applies to the submitted information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). We note the requestor provided the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for some of the body worn camera recordings at issue. As the body worn camera recordings we indicated were properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, we will address the department's arguments against their disclosure, as well as against disclosure of the remaining information. However, the requestor did not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue. As the requestor did not properly request the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information with respect to them and they need not be released to the requestor.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a "failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information." *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

The department claims the remaining information should be withheld under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime...if...it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* However, the department claims the information pertains to a pending prosecution and release of the information associated with the investigation could hinder the proper prosecution of the crime and potentially affect the case. Therefore, upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the information at issue relates to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *See id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To

²As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the department's arguments against disclosure of this information.

demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor has a right of access to his client's date of birth under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, with the exception of the requestor’s client’s date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, none of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest and thus, none of it may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See* ORD 455 at 4. The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy,” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5thCir. 1985)). Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to his client’s own motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code, and it may not be withheld from him under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining

information is of the type made confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code and thus, none of it may be withheld on that basis.

In summary, with the exception of the body worn camera recordings we have indicated, as the requestor did not properly request the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. With the exception of the requestor's client's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/tdw

Ref: ID# 676235

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).