



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 20, 2017

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law & Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-21508

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 676566 (ORR# 2017-13088).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to four named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹We note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider their applicability to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352. Although the department does not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand it to raise this exception based on its markings.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find report number 132818-2016 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this

section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find report number 132818-2016 is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Family Court Services Division of the Dallas County Domestic Relations Office (the “domestic relations office”) and has provided an authorized release signed by the parents of the child victim named in the information at issue. Further, the parents are not alleged to have committed the abuse. Therefore, the department may not withhold report number 132818-2016 from the requestor under section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). We also note section 261.201(1)(2) states that any information excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Thus, we will consider your remaining arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code for report number 132818-2016.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 13 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(b)); *see also* Fam. Code § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1304, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find report number 2003-0388114 involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Therefore, the department must withhold report number 2003-0388114 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.³ You also assert report number 2004-0276829 is confidential under section 58.008(b). However, you have failed to demonstrate report number 2004-276829 depicts an individual who is ten years of age or older and under the age of seventeen as a suspect or offender of delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.008). Therefore, the department may not withhold report number 2004-0276829 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

You assert the dates of birth are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note, the requestor is an authorized representative of the parents of one of the minor children whose private information is at issue. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to private information pertaining to these individuals that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.023(a) (“person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, with the exception of the dates of birth to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Gov’t Code* § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³We note the information at issue does not contain criminal history record information (“CHRI”) of the individuals named in the request for information. Therefore, we do not address whether the requestor, who has been appointed by the domestic relations office to complete a court-ordered social study involving the individuals named in the request, has a right of access to CHRI under sections 411.087 and 411.1285(a) of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .1285(a). As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

In summary, the department must withhold report number 2003-0388114 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of the dates of birth to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/sb

Ref: ID# 676566

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)