



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 31, 2017

Ms. Halfreda Anderson-Nelson
Senior Assistant General Counsel
Dallas Area Rapid Transit
P.O. Box 660163
Dallas, Texas 75266-0163

OR2017-19962

Dear Ms. Anderson-Nelson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 674179 (DART ORR# W001742-061517).

Dallas Area Rapid Transit (the "DART") received a request for the internal affairs records of all officers disciplined under a specified general order and a copy of the specified general order. DART states it has released some information to the requestor. DART claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, the following:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). DART states the information it indicated consists of juvenile law enforcement records. Upon review, we agree some of the information at issue involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.² However, we find the remaining information at issue consists of administrative records. We note section 58.007(c) is only applicable to law enforcement records. Accordingly, DART may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 452.061 of the Transportation Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(e) Personal identifying information collected by an authority is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, including a person’s:

(1) name, address, e-mail address, and phone number;

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address DART’s remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(2) account number, password, payment transaction activity, toll or charge record, or credit, debit, or other payment card number; and

(3) other personal financial information.

Transp. Code § 452.061(e). We understand DART is a regional transportation authority governed by chapter 452 of the Transportation Code. *See id.* ch. 452; *see also id.* § 452.001(1) (defining “authority” for purposes of chapter 452 of the Transportation Code). We note subsection 452.061(e) is contained in section 452.061, which is titled “Fares and Other Charges.” Additionally, subsections (a) through (d) of section 452.061 discuss an authority’s responsibilities in imposing fares and other charges and the state’s power to regulate taxes imposed by an authority or other compensation authorized by this section. *See id.* § 452.061(a)–(d). Accordingly, we conclude section 452.061(e) is only applicable to personal identifying information collected by DART for purposes relating to the collection of fares and other charges. *Cf. Paxton v. Tex. Dep’t of State Health Servs.*, 500 S.W.3d 702, 706 (Tex. App.—Austin 2016, no pet.) (holding although isolated reading of section 531.1021(g) of Government Code suggests it applies to any Office of Inspector General (“OIG”) investigation, confidentiality of OIG investigations provided by section 531.1021(g) must be read in context of OIG’s enabling provisions and thus, extended only to OIG investigations concerning fraud, waste, and abuse in the provision and delivery of health and human services in the state). Upon review, we find the remaining information does not contain any personal identifying information of individuals for purposes relating to the collection of fares and other charges. Consequently, the remaining information is not confidential under section 452.061(e) of the Transportation Code, and may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to the records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.) (section 552.108 generally not applicable to law enforcement agency’s personnel records); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App. —El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). However, DART informs us the information it indicated relates to a pending criminal case that is being investigated by DART. The records demonstrate the officer whose information is at issue was a responding officer in the pending criminal case. Based upon DART’s representation and our review, we conclude release of the information it indicated will interfere with the

detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information DART indicated.


However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, DART may withhold the information it indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, DART may withhold the information it indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. DART must release the remaining information.

DART also asks this office to issue a previous determination authorizing it to withhold personal identifying information collected by DART under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 452.061 of the Transportation Code. We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Gerald A. Arismendez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GAA/tdw

Ref: ID# 674179

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)