



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 31, 2017

Mr. Darrell G-M Noga  
Counsel for City of Coppell  
Cantey Hanger, LLP  
1999 Bryan Street, Suite 3300  
Dallas, Texas 75201-6822

OR2017-19916

Dear Mr. Noga:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 675323 (ORR Nos. W002727 & W002737).

The Coppell Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received two requests from the same requestor seeking information pertaining to a specified incident. The department states it has released some of the requested information. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

- (a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

---

<sup>1</sup>Although the department does not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the department to raise this exception based on its markings.

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by

Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The information at issue involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). In this instance, the requestor is a parent of one of the juvenile offenders at issue. Therefore, this requestor has a right to inspect information concerning her child under section 58.007(e), and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. *Id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor's child must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). Further, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, we will address the department's argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code with respect to the responsive information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), 301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the submitted information pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the remaining information submitted as Group 5 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ*

*ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the remaining information in Group 5 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code, which states any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor's child shall be withheld from disclosure. Fam. Code § 58.007(j)(1). Upon review, we find the information we marked in the documents submitted as Group 3 consists of identifying information of suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses who were juveniles at the time the conduct occurred and who are not the requestor's child. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked in Group 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note some of the dates of birth the department seeks to withhold relate to the requestor's minor child or to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interests are thus protected. This information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(a) ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.


In summary, the submitted body worn camera recordings were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and they need not be released. The department may withhold the remaining information in Group 5 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked in Group 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in Group 3 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/bw

Ref: ID# 675323

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released in this instance. If the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).