



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 30, 2017

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldon, Jr.  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2017-19893

Dear Mr. Gabaldon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 673921.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports pertaining to a named individual during a specific date range. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

---

<sup>1</sup>Although the department raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy, the department has not submitted arguments explaining how constitutional privacy applies to the submitted information. Therefore, we assume the department has withdrawn this claim. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request. Thus, the request implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note, however, the department has submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate the individual's right to privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold this information as a compilation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note portions of report number 11-071010 are confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The two-prong test for common-law privacy was discussed above. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 681-82. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455* (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find portions of report number 11-071010 satisfy the standard articulated in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked, and all public citizens' dates of birth, in report number 11-071010 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, none of the remaining information in report number 11-071010 is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest and thus, none of it may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold

any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked, and all public citizens' dates of birth, in report number 11-071010 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information in report number 11-071010.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RSH/tdw

Ref: ID# 673921

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)