



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 22, 2017

Mr. Frank J. Garza  
Counsel for the Brownsville Public Utility Board  
Davidson Troilo Ream & Garza, PC  
601 North West Loop 410, Suite 100  
San Antonio, Texas 78216-5511

OR2017-19153

Dear Mr. Garza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 671961.

The Brownsville Public Utility Board (the "board"), which you represent, received a request for bids, bid tabulations, and scoring sheets pertaining to a specific RFP. Although the board takes no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, the board informs us release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of Holmes Murphy; HUB International; McGriff, Seibels & Williams; The Nitsche Group; Valley Risk Consulting, Inc.; and Wethe & Associates, Inc. Accordingly, the board states, and provides documentation showing, it notified the third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information at issue should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the board has not submitted bid tabulations or scoring sheets. Thus, to the extent any additional responsive information existed when the present request was received, we assume it has been released. If such information has not been released, then it must be released at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision

No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from any third parties explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any of the third parties has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the board may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest any of the third parties may have in the information.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Upon review, the board must withhold the insurance policy numbers in the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the board must withhold the insurance policy numbers in the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The board must release the

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

remaining information; however, any information protected by copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RSH/tdw

Ref: ID# 671961

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

6 Third Parties  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person without requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).