



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 15, 2017

Ms. Ileana Fernandez  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2017-18525

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 672016.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You state you will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. We note the submitted information contains recordings from department officers' body worn cameras. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides:

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). We note the requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code for release of the body worn camera recordings at issue. The submitted recordings reflect they were required to be made by law or the policies of the department and relate to a law enforcement purpose. *See id.* § 1701.661(h). Further, we understand the recordings are or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution. *See id.* § 1701.661(d). Additionally, we have no indication the recordings document an incident that involves the use of deadly force by an officer or relate to an administrative or criminal investigation of an officer. *See id.* § 1701.660(a). The submitted recordings demonstrate they were not made in a private space for the purposes of section 1701.661(f). *See id.* §§ 1701.661(f), .651(3) (defining “private space” for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person’s authorized representative.

*Id.* § 1701.661(f). Upon review, we are unable to determine whether the submitted body worn camera recordings involve an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. If the submitted body worn camera recordings involve an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, we note there is no indication the department has received written authorizations for release from all of the subjects of the recording. Accordingly, in this instance, the submitted body worn camera recordings are confidential and must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.661(f). However, if the submitted body worn camera recordings do not involve an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, no portion of the recording is confidential under section 1701.661(f) and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. In that instance, we will address your remaining arguments for the body worn camera recordings.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is

generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (finding personal financial information to include designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care). Upon review, we find the information you have indicated satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we note some of the information at issue may belong to the requestor's client. The requestor has a right of access to private information belonging to her client pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Therefore, to the extent the information you have indicated pertains to the requestor's client, it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of any information that belongs to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information consist of motor vehicle record information. Thus, the department must generally withhold the discernible and audible motor vehicle record information from the remaining recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we note section 552.130 protects privacy. In this instance, the requestor may have a right of access to some of the motor vehicle record information at issue under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. To the extent the motor vehicle record information in the submitted recordings belongs to the requestor's client, she has a right of access under section 552.023 to this information, and the department may not withhold such information under section 552.130 from the requestor. To the extent the motor vehicle record information at issue does not belong to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the discernible and audible motor vehicle record information in the remaining recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. However, the purpose of section 552.136 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to her client's insurance policy number pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, with the

exception of the requestor's client's information, the department must withhold the insurance policy numbers you indicated under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the submitted body worn camera recordings involve an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. With the exception of any information that belongs to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the motor vehicle record information at issue does not belong to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the discernible and audible motor vehicle record information in the remaining recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of the requestor's client's information, the department must withhold the insurance policy numbers you indicated under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KSM/sb

Ref: ID# 672016

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)