



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 8, 2017

Mr. Bobby Maldonado
Counsel for the City of Pearsall
Maldonado Diaz, P.L.L.C.
310 South Saint Mary's Street, Suite 1940
San Antonio, Texas 78205

OR2017-17821

Dear Mr. Maldonado:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 669640.

The City of Pearsall (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for specified meeting agendas and minutes, as well as all complaints and investigations of the requestor. You inform us the city does not have some of the requested information.¹ You state the city has released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.107 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains agendas and minutes of public meetings. The agendas and minutes of a governmental body's public meetings are specifically made public under provisions of the Open Meetings Act, chapter 551 of the

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

²Although you also assert section 552.111 of the Government Code, you make no argument in support of this claim. Accordingly, we assume you no longer assert section 552.111. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.301(e)(1)(A), .302.

Government Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 551.022 (minutes and tape recordings of open meeting are public records and shall be available for public inspection and copying on request to governmental body's chief administrative officer or officer's designee), .041 (governmental body shall give written notice of date, hour, place, and subject of each meeting), .043 (notice of meeting of governmental body must be posted in place readily accessible to general public for at least 72 hours before scheduled time of meeting). Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.103 of the Government Code, as a general rule, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Accordingly, the city must release Exhibits D, E, and F pursuant to Chapter 551 of the Government Code.

We next note you inform us the city released Exhibit G to the requestor in response to the instant request for information. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides if a governmental body voluntarily releases information to any member of the public, the governmental body may not withhold such information from further disclosure unless its public release is expressly prohibited by law. *See* Gov't Code 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 400 at 2 (1983). Section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). As such, section 552.103 does not expressly prohibit the release of the information at issue or make the information confidential. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the previously-released information under section 552.103. However, section 552.130 makes information confidential under the Act.³ Therefore, we will consider the applicability of section 552.130 to the information the city previously released. Additionally, we will consider sections 552.103 and 552.107 for the remaining information not previously released.

We also note Exhibit H is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). Exhibit H consists of a completed report subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The city must release the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information at issue under sections 552.103 and 552.107 of the Government Code. However, sections 552.103 and 552.107 are discretionary in nature and do not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit*, 4 S.W.3d at 475-76; *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 10-11 (2002) (attorney-client privilege under Gov't Code § 552.107(1) may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the city may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) under section 552.103 or section 552.107. However, the Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Accordingly, we will consider your assertion of the attorney-client privilege under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence for the information at issue.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503(b)(1) provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

(A) between the client or the client's representative and the client's lawyer or the lawyer's representative;

(B) between the client's lawyer and the lawyer's representative;

(C) by the client, the client's representative, the client's lawyer, or the lawyer's representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer's representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;

(D) between the client's representatives or between the client and the client's representative; or

(E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is "confidential" if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client or reasonably necessary to transmit the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Accordingly, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must 1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; 2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and 3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. *See* ORD 676. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the entire communication is confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the communication does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein); *In re Valero Energy Corp.*, 973 S.W.2d 453, 457 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1998, orig. proceeding) (privilege attaches to complete communication, including factual information).

You assert Exhibit H consists of a privileged attorney-client communication between city officials and outside counsel for the city made for the purpose of the rendition of legal services to the city. You state the information at issue has not been, and was not intended to be, disclosed to third parties. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find the city has established Exhibit H constitutes an attorney-client communication under rule 503. *See Harlandale Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Cornyn*, 25 S.W.3d 328 (Tex. App.—Austin 2000, pet. denied) (concluding attorney's entire investigative report was protected by attorney-client privilege where attorney was retained to conduct investigation in her capacity as attorney for purpose of providing legal services and advice). Accordingly, the city may withhold Exhibit H pursuant to rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked within Exhibit G under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must release Exhibits D, E, and F pursuant to Chapter 551 of the Government Code. The city may withhold Exhibit H pursuant to rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked within Exhibit G under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 669640

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)