



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 4, 2017

Mr. John P. Beauchamp
General Counsel
Texas Commission on Law Enforcement
6330 East Highway 290, Suite 200
Austin, Texas 78723-1035

OR2017-17638

Dear Mr. Beauchamp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 669610.

The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement (the "commission") received a request for information pertaining to a named officer. The commission claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information contains the commission identification number of a peace officer. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as

information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

¹We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's commission identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the commission website. Accordingly, we find the commission identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the submitted commission identification number is not subject to the Act and the commission is not required to release it.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to the commission under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

- (a) All information submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the commission's remaining argument to withhold this information.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a commission member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The submitted information contains F-5 forms that were submitted to the commission pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. You state the officer at issue did not resign and was not terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the commission must withhold the submitted F-5 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. We note you also seek to withhold a form E-1 (“Report of Criminal Charges”) and a form T-1 (Telecommunicator Appointment/Separation) under section 1701.454. This section is applicable only to the records encompassed by subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, however, and does not make a form E-1 or a form T-1 confidential. *See id.* § 1701.451 *et seq.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Therefore, we conclude the commission may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in part, the following:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person’s office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov’t Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.103 has the burden of providing relevant facts and documentation sufficient to establish the applicability of this exception to the information that it seeks to withhold. To meet this burden, the governmental body must demonstrate that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to the pending or anticipated litigation. *See Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d

210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990).

In order to demonstrate that litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must provide this office “concrete evidence showing that the claim that litigation might ensue is more than mere conjecture.” Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). In the context of anticipated litigation in which the governmental body is the prospective plaintiff, the concrete evidence must at least reflect that litigation is “realistically contemplated.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 518 at 5 (1989); *see also* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982) (finding that investigatory file may be withheld from disclosure if governmental body attorney determines that it should be withheld pursuant to section 552.103 and that litigation is “reasonably likely to result”). Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* ORD 452 at 4.

You contend the remaining information relates to litigation anticipated by the commission. Although you indicate the commission may initiate “future administrative actions,” the commission provided no explanation of any potential action or that such action constitutes litigation. Upon review, we find the commission has failed to demonstrate it reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the request for information. Therefore, the commission may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This section encompasses the attorney work product privilege found in Rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure. *City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351, 360 (Tex. 2000); Open Records Decision No. 677 at 4-8 (2002). Rule 192.5 defines work product as

(1) material prepared or mental impressions developed in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for a party or a party’s representatives, including the party’s attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees, or agents; or

(2) a communication made in anticipation of litigation or for trial between a party and the party’s representatives or among a party’s representatives, including the party’s attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees or agents.

TEX. R. CIV. P. 192.5(a). A governmental body seeking to withhold information under this exception bears the burden of demonstrating the information was created or developed for trial or in anticipation of litigation by or for a party or a party’s representative. TEX. R. CIV.

P. 192.5; ORD 677 at 6-8. In order for this office to conclude the information was made or developed in anticipation of litigation, we must be satisfied that

a) a reasonable person would have concluded from the totality of the circumstances surrounding the investigation that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue; and b) the party resisting discovery believed in good faith that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue and [created or obtained the information] for the purpose of preparing for such litigation.

Nat'l Tank Co. v. Brotherton, 851 S.W.2d 193, 207 (Tex. 1993). A “substantial chance” of litigation does not mean a statistical probability, but rather “that litigation is more than merely an abstract possibility or unwarranted fear.” *Id.* at 204; ORD 677 at 7.

Upon review, we find the commission has failed to establish the information at issue consists of material prepared, mental impressions developed, or a communication made in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for the commission or representatives of the commission. *See Nat'l Tank*, 851 S.W.2d at 206 (information created in ordinary course of business constitutes work product if agency demonstrates primary motivating purpose for preparation of information was in anticipation of litigation); *see also* ORD 677 at 7. Therefore, the commission may not withhold the remaining information as attorney work product under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the commission must withhold the public citizen's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code.³ Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to “peace officers as defined by

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]” *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1). Some of the remaining information relates to an individual who was licensed as a peace officer of a law enforcement agency at the time the information at issue was created. However, we are unable to determine from the information provided if the individual at issue is currently a licensed peace officer. Thus, we must rule conditionally. Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue, which we marked, relates to an individual who is currently a licensed peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the commission must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Conversely, if the individual whose information is at issue is not currently a licensed peace officer or does not elect to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the marked information may not be withheld under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator’s license or driver’s license or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by a Texas agency, or an agency of another state or country. *See id.* § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Upon review, we find the commission must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the submitted commission identification number is not subject to the Act and the commission is not required to release this information. The commission must withhold the submitted F-5 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The commission must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The commission must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the marked information relates to an individual who is currently a licensed peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b). The commission must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The commission must release the remaining information.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

⁴We note the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.147(b)

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S. Pounds', written in a cursive style.

Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/sdk

Ref: ID# 669610

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)