



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 3, 2017

Ms. Sabrina E. Fernandez
Public Information Unit
Katy Independent School District
P.O. Box 159
Katy, Texas 77492-0159

OR2017-17502

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 669918 (PIR# 16598_40_Smith).

The Katy Independent School District (the "district") received a request for specified information related to a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note portions of the submitted information are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information includes completed reports and evaluations that are subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The district must release these

completed reports and evaluations pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022, which we have marked, may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We note sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 make information confidential under the Act.¹ Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code to this information. Additionally, we will consider your argument under section 552.103 against disclosure of the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). We note contested cases conducted under the Administration Procedure Act (the “APA”), chapter 2001 of the Government Code, are considered litigation for purposes of section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision No. 588 at 7 (1991). We further note a contested case before the State Office of Administrative Hearings (“SOAH”) is considered litigation for purposes of the APA. *See id.*

You state, and submit documentation showing, prior to the day the district received the instant request, the requestor requested a hearing through the Texas Education Agency in regards to the termination of the requestor’s client. We note that such hearings are governed by the APA and thus constitute litigation for purposes of section 552.103. *See* Educ. Code § 21.041(b)(7); 19 T.A.C. § 249.4(a)(1). You inform us the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code is related to the pending litigation. Based on your representations, and our review of the information at issue, we find litigation was pending when the district received this request for information, and the information at issue is related to the pending litigation for the purposes of section 552.103. Therefore, the district may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing parties in the anticipated litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government

Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.117(a)(1), .24. Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee's or former employee's social security number." *Id.* § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Therefore, to the extent the employees at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. Conversely, to the extent the employees at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the district may not withhold the information under section 552.117(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "[t]he social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential." *Id.* § 552.147(a-1). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the social security numbers of district employees we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must release the information we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the

extent the employees at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the social security numbers of district employees we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Buchanan
Attorney
Open Records Division

EB/eb

Ref: ID# 669918

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, the district must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.